

Comhairle Cathrach Chorcaí Cork City Council

Quality Assurance Report 2022

To Be Submitted to the National Oversight Audit Committee in Compliance with the Public Spending Code

National Oversight and Audit Commission, NOAC Secretariat, Custom House, Dublin 1.

31 May 2023

Dear Sir / Madam,

Re: Certification of Public Spending Code, Quality Assurance Report for Cork City Council 2022

This Quality Assurance Report reflects Cork City Council's assessment of compliance with the Public Spending Code. It is based on the best financial, organisational and performance related information available across the various areas of responsibility.

Yours faithfully,

Ann Doherty, Chief Executive Cork City Council

Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. Expenditure Analysis	4
3. Assessment of Compliance	6
4. Next Steps: Quality Assurance Process	9
5. Conclusion	10

Appendix 1: Inventory of Projects and Programmes above €0.5m

Appendix 2: Checklists - Assessment of Compliance

Appendix 3: In-depth Checks

1. Introduction

Cork City Council has completed this Quality Assurance (QA) Report as part of its on-going compliance with the Public Spending Code (PSC).

The Quality Assurance procedure aims to gauge the extent to which Cork City Council is meeting the obligations set out in the Public Spending Code. The Public Spending Code ensures that the State achieves value for money in the use of all public funds.

The Quality Assurance Process contains five steps:

- 1. Drawing up Inventories of all projects/programmes at different stages of the Project Life Cycle (appraisal, planning/design, implementation, post implementation). The three sections are expenditure being considered, expenditure being incurred and expenditure that has recently ended and the inventory includes all capital projects/programmes above €0.5m and all current expenditure as per the annual budget process above €0.5m.
- 2. Publish summary information on website of all procurements in excess of €10m, whether new, in progress or completed.
- 3. Checklists to be completed in respect of the different stages. These checklists allow the Council to self-assess their compliance with the code in respect of the checklists which are provided through the PSC document.
- **4.** Carry out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected objects / programmes. A number of projects or programmes are selected to be reviewed more intensively. This includes a review of all projects from ex-post to ex-ante.
- 5. Complete a short report for the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform which includes the inventory of all projects, the website reference for the publication of procurements above €10m, the completed checklists, the Council's judgement on the adequacy of processes given the findings from the in-depth checks and proposals to remedy any discovered inadequacies.

This report fulfils the fifth requirement of the QA Process for Cork City Council for 2022.

2. Expenditure Analysis

2.1 Inventory of Projects/Programmes

This section details the inventory drawn up by Cork City Council in accordance with the guidance on the Quality Assurance process. The inventory lists all of the Council's projects and programmes at various stages of the project life cycle which amount to more than €0.5m. This inventory is divided between current and capital projects and between three stages:

- A) Expenditure being considered
- B) Expenditure being incurred
- C) Expenditure that has recently ended

Details of the capital projects and revenue programmes included in the inventory for 2022 are set out in Appendix 1. Expenditure included under the Council's revenue programmes has been included in the same heading format as the 2022 adopted Budget approved by the Elected Members of the Council.

The full inventory can be found in **Appendix 1** of this report.

2.2 Published Summary of Procurements

As part of the Quality Assurance process Cork City Council has published summary information on our website of all procurements in excess of €10m. Listed below is the link to this publication page and an illustration of its location.

Link to Procurement Publications:

procurement-project-details.pdf (corkcity.ie)

3. Assessment of Compliance

3.1 Checklist Completion: Approach Taken and Results

The third step in the Quality Assurance process involves completing a set of checklists covering all expenditure. The high-level checks in Step 3 of the QA process are based on self-assessment by each of the Directorates and Departments within Cork City Council, in respect of guidelines set out in the Public Spending Code. There are seven checklists in total:

Checklist 1: General Obligations Not Specific to Individual Projects/Programmes

Checklist 2: Capital Projects/Programmes or Capital Grant Schemes Being Considered

Checklist 3: New Current Expenditure Being Considered

Checklist 4: Capital Projects/Programmes or Capital Grant Schemes Being Incurred

Checklist 5: Current Expenditure Being Incurred

Checklist 6: Capital Projects/Programmes or Capital Grant Schemes Expenditure Discontinued

Checklist 7: Current Expenditure Reaching the End of Planned Timeframe or Discontinued

- In addition to the self-assessed scoring, the majority of answers are accompanied by explanatory comments. Each question in the checklist is judged using the following scoring mechanism:
 - Scope for significant improvements = a score of 1
 - Compliant but with some improvement necessary = a score of 2
 - Broadly compliant = a score of 3

The set of completed checklists are set out in **Appendix 2** of this report.

3.2 Main Issues Arising from Checklist Assessment

The completed checklists show the extent to which Cork City Council believes that it complies with the Public Spending Code.

Capital Programmes / Projects are appraised and implemented using formal project-based structures and the majority of their funding is granted directly from exchequer funding after formal application procedures are complied with. The relevant checklists show the result of a self-assessment exercise completed by the project owners within the various Directorates and Departments of the Council.

Current expenditure programmes are annual expenditure streams which are formally adopted by Council Members each year as part of the statutory budget process. Ongoing budgetary control reporting and monitoring is carried out during each year. The relevant checklists have been completed by the Finance Department.

Cork City Council meets the requirements of the Public Spending Code and Quality Assurance reporting as evidenced by the completed checklist. There continues to be a focus on compliance with the Public Spending Code across the organisation.

3.3 In-Depth Checks

The Council's Internal Audit function carried out the in-depth checks required under Step 4 of the Quality Assurance process. For 2022 review, five projects / programmes were selected, one from a Current Expenditure programme with Expenditure being Incurred and four Capital Projects also under Expenditure Being Incurred on the Project Inventory. Details of the checks are as follows:

In- Depth Checks 2022	€ millions
Revenue Programme – Expenditure being Incurred	
Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme	€7.4m
Total Value of Revenue Programme In-depth Reviews	
Total Revenue Programme Inventory 2022	€259.21m
% Reviewed	3%
Capital Project – Expenditure Being Incurred	
Church Road Housing Development	€11.25m
Killeens Housing Development	€15.92m
Dominick Street Housing Development	€3.18m
Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme	€19.9m
Total Value of Capital Projects In-depth Reviews	€50.25m
Total Capital Project Inventory 2022	€326.13m
% Reviewed	15%
2022 Overall Percentage Reviewed	9%

The set of completed In-Depth Check Reports are contained in **Appendix 3** of this report.

Current Expenditure Programme - Expenditure being Incurred Programme Selected:

Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme

For the purpose of the in-depth checks' requirement, Internal Audit chose a sample of one current expenditure programme representing a percentage of 3%. The current expenditure Programme under review is the Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme. In 2022, the cost of the Operation of the Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme was €7,400,000 (overall programme expenditure was €24m). This Programme was categorised as current expenditure being incurred in the 2022 public spending code quality assurance inventory listing.

The Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme is a scheme to cater for the accommodation needs of people who are in receipt of Rent Supplement for more than 18 months and who have long-term housing needs. The scheme is administered by Local Authorities who enter contractual arrangements with accommodation providers to secure the medium to long-term availability of private rented accommodation. RAS provides a more structured, accommodation-based approach to the use of the private rented sector to meet long-term housing need reducing dependence on temporary income support payments.

There are several documents that define the objectives of the Programme, Cork City Council's Annual Service Delivery Plan 2022, Annual Budget 2022, City Council's Corporate Plan to 2024. There is also evidence of planning and monitoring of the RAS Programme expenditure through the Annual Budget 2022, financial management system financial reports and monitoring reports.

The staff responsible for administering the RAS scheme perform a task with many elements, complexities, and difficulties. A great deal of time and effort is directed to dealing with the more qualitative aspects of the scheme, i.e., tenants, landlords.

On completion of the in-depth review of the Cork City Council's Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme, Internal Audit has formed the opinion that that the financial and administrative procedures offer satisfactory assurance of being in compliance with the public spending code.

Capital Expenditure Projects Selected:

Church Road Housing Development

The project involves the purchase of land situated at Church Road in the Blackrock area of Cork City and the development of thirty dwelling units with an approved overall budget of €11,253,600. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Church Road Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code. To ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Killeens Housing Development

The project involves the purchase of land situated in the Killeens area of Cork City and the development of forty-four units with an approved overall budget of €15,917,996. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Church Road Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code. To ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Dominick Street Housing Development

The project involves the purchase of land situated at No. 21 and 22 Dominick Street, Cork, and the development of nine dwelling units, with an approved overall budget of €3,177,288. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Church Road Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code. To ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme

The Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme has the objective of being a technically, socially, environmentally, and economically acceptable alleviation of the risk of flooding to the Glanmire/Sallybrook areas and environs. The estimated construction cost of the scheme is in the region of €20m. The flood relief scheme is funded from within the allocated €1 billion for flood risk management over the period 2018-2027. Provision for the cost of the scheme is included in the Office of Public Works' multi annual capital allocation.

Appropriate appraisal of the scheme was conducted as evidenced by the Environmental Impact Statement addendum and a Cost Benefit Analysis. On-going monitoring and evaluation of the scheme's implementation is met through the comprehensive monthly management reports that are prepared. The main works construction contract is scheduled to commence in July 2023 and to be substantially completed in 32 months. There is strong project management in situ and a system of robust controls in place as the project progresses. The project has been impacted by delays at the appraisal stage because of new procedures introduced as a result of changes in EU legislation, and delays due to the original preferred works contractor requesting their removal from the tender process in 2022.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in substantial compliance with the Public Spending Code. To ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

4. Next Steps: Quality Assurance Process

The compilation of both the inventory and checklists for the quality assurance process was a significant co-ordination task in terms of liaising with various sections, departments and directors. This process of

engagement has meant further progress has been made in incorporating the PSC and its requirements and ensuring a consistent level of compliance into all relevant activities throughout Cork City Council and among the relevant staff.

On the basis of the checklists completed by the project owners of capital projects, together with those completed by the Finance Department on current expenditure and the In-depth checks undertaken by Internal Audit, Cork City Council have assurance that there are satisfactory levels of compliance with the requirements of the Public Spending Code.

Cork City Council will continue knowledge sharing and increasing awareness of the Public Spending Code throughout 2023 with an emphasis of embedding regular post project reviews. With a view to maintaining a strong awareness of the of the requirements of the Code, the Quality Assurance Report will be circulated at Senior Management level.

5. Conclusion

Cork City Council has completed the necessary steps in the Quality Assurance Process and has prepared the required inventory showing all the relevant expenditure. The inventory outlined in this report lists the revenue and capital expenditure that is being considered, being incurred, and that has recently ended. The single procurement in excess of €10 million is published in Cork City Council website. The checklists completed by the organisation and in-depth checks show a substantial level of compliance with the Public Spending Code. Continuing progress is required by all sections within the Council to ensure that the level of substantial compliance with the Code is maintained.

Appendix 1 Inventory of Projects and Programmes above €0.5m

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)

		Current Expenditure Amount in	Capital Expenditure Amount in	Capital Expenditure Amount in	Project/Programme		Explanatory
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Reference Year	Reference Year (Non Grant)	Reference Year (Grant)	Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure	Notes
Housing & Building					-		
A01 MAINTENANCE/ IMPROVEMENT OF LA H	Maintenance of LA housing for Cork City	€ 1,896,200	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
A05 ADMINISTRATION OF HOMELESS SERVICE	Homeless Services Administration	€ 1,230,400	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
A07 RAS PROGRAMME	Rental Assistance Scheme Operations	€ 3,479,700	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
CALF	Capital Assistance leasing	€ -	€ -	€ -	Rolling	€ 1,638,470)
BALLYHOOLY ROAD	Social Housing Prog - LA	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 9,195,900).
COMPETITIVE DIALOGUE 3 - A	Social Housing Prog - LA	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 141,176,872	
COMPETITIVE DIALOGUE 3 - B	Social Housing Prog - LA	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 12,401,250).
COMPETITIVE DIALOGUE 3 - B	Social Housing Prog - LA	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 16,345,141	
FUTURE SOCIAL HOUSING PROGRAMME 2024	Social Housing Programme 2024 to 2025	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 47,840,000)
MADONNA HOUSE (PHASE 3)	Social Housing Prog - LA	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 1,001,101	
COMP DIALOGUE LWR JOHN ST,SHAN	Development of 3 housing units	€ -	€ -	€ -	Jun-24	988,182	
FABRIC UPGRADE PROG PHASE 2 18	Fabric Upgrade for Local Authority Housing	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 584,325	i
4 UNITS WYCHERLEY PLACE	Development of 4 Housing Units	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 1,174,681	
Road Transportation & Safety							
B01 NP ROAD - MAINTENANCE & IMPROVEM	Maintenance & Improvement of National I	€ 1,566,900	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
B04 LOCAL ROAD - MAIN&IMPROVE	Maintenance & Improvement of Local Road	€ 2,283,900	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
B05 LOCAL ROAD - PUBLIC LIGHTING	Public Lighting Expenditure	€ 1,717,400	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
B06 TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT IMPROVEMENT	Traffic Management Expenditure	€ 579,100	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
B09 CAR PARKING	Car Parking Expenditure	€ 669,100	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
B10 SUPPORT TO ROADS CAPITAL PROG	Staffing Infratructure and Overheads for Ca	€ 826,600	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
SOUTH DOCKLANDS TRANSPORT INFRASTRU	Docklands Development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 1,385,000).
REPAIR OF BRIDGES (Bridges to be selected)	Repair of Bridges	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 750,000).
WELLINGTON RD CYCLEWAY	Cycle improvements	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 2,700,000	
CORK CITY NORTHERN TRANSPORT	Improve regional accesibility and connective	€ -	€ 348,080	€ -	2024	1,454,807	
TRAMORE V.P. CYCLE/PATH UPGRAD	Resurcaing of carpark and pedestrian	€ -	€ 352,393	€ -	2023	8 € 688,230	

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)							
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure	Explanatory Notes
Development Management							
D02 DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT	Planning and Development Expenditure	€ 730,200	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
D09 ECONOMIC DEVLOPMENT & PROMOTIOI	Local Enterprise Office	€ 838,000	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
CORK CITY DOCKLANDS - URDF2	Urban renewal	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 36,380,000	
TOWN & VILLAGE RENEWAL	Urban renewal	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 605,000	
Library site URDF	Urban renewal	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 21,000,000	
SHANDON ENTERPRISE CENTRE	Upgrade Works	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 3,600,000	
DOCKLANDS-INFRASTRUCTURE PLAN	Infrastructure Planning				Expected 2025	€ 3,840,000	
DOCKLANDS - ACQUIRE CITY QUAYS	Acquisition of City Quys	€ -	€ -	€ -	Expected 2024	€ 10,170,000	
SHANDON BUTTER EXCHANGE REGEN	Refurbishment, setting up and managemen	€ -	€ -	€ -	2025	5 € 4,800,000	
Environmental Services							
E10 SAFETY OF STRUCTURES & PLACES	Derelict Sites	€ 1,295,900			Rolling - Current Exp		
E11 OPERATION OF FIRE SERVICES	Operation of Fire Brigade Services	€ 1,748,500			Rolling - Current Exp		
Recreation and Amenity							
F02 OPERATION OF LIBRARY & ARCHIVAL SER	Library operations	€ 1,738,300	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
F03 OUTDOOR LEISURE AREAS OPERATIONS	Parks and Playgrounds	€ 765,500	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
Nth West Regional Park	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 5,500,000	
Glanmire Playground	Playground upgrade	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 950,000	
Inch Park Development	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 750,000	
Nth East Regional Park	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 5,000,000	
Bell's Field	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 500,000	
NTA FUNDED WALKING/CYCLE PATHS	NTA initiatives	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 6,000,000	
Mahonys Ave	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 2,000,000	
Ennismore Lands	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 2,000,000	
Bus Connects + Modal Priority	Transportation	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 950,000	
Eden Car Park	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 500,000	
Blarney Playground	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 500,000	
Ballincollig Regional Park	Park development	€ -	€ -	€ -	Under consideration	€ 750,000	
Miscellaneous Services							
H11 AGENCY & RECOUPABLE SERVICES	Energy Costs	€ 1,365,600	€ -	€ -	Rolling - Current Exp	€ -	
Totals		€ 22,731,300	€ 700,473	€ -		€ 345,118,958	

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current) Capital Expenditure Amount Current Expenditure in Reference Year (Non Capital Expenditure Amount | Project/Programme **Cumulative Expenditure to-Projected Lifetime** Explanatory **Amount in Reference Year** Project/Scheme/Programme Name Short Description n Reference Year (Grant) Anticipated Timeline **Expenditure (Capital Only)** date Housing & Building A01 MAINT/IMP LA HOUSING UNITS Repairs and Maintenance of LA Hous € 19.265.674 € 1,001,655 A02 HOUSING ASSESS, ALLOC & TRANSFE Assessment of Housing Needs A03 HOUSING RENT & TENANT PURCHAS Debt Management & Rent Assessme € 1,732,811 € 6,690,707 € € A04 HOUSING COMM DEVELOP SUPPORT Housing Estate Management & Supp € A05 ADMIN OF HOMELESS SERVICE Homeless Services Administration 19,827,517 € € A06 SUPPORT TO HOUSING CAPITAL PRO Mainly relates to loan charges and te € 2,808,557 A07 RAS PROGRAMME Rental Assistance Scheme Operation € 24,129,688 € 990,569 A08 HOUSING LOANS Loan Interest & Charges and Debt Ma € A09 HOUSING GRANTS Disabled Persons Grants 4,338,559 € € A11 AGENCY & RECOUPABLE SERVICES Agency & Recoupable and Support Se € 1,647,218 BRAMBLE COTTAGES, POPHAMS RD 177,258 Dev 4 units € 50,642 Apr-24 1,337,564 ROOFLINE REPAIRS Cleaning/Installation/Repairs to the € € 1.658 4 vears 3.795.619 4.000.000 **ROOF REPAIRS 2019** Cleaning/Installation/Repairs to the € € 951,061 1,238,101 1,000,000 - 4 years CENTRAL HEATING INSTALLATION 19 This contract is designed to meet the € €. 207,618 4 years 985,562 1,000,000 WINDOWS & DOORS Replacement of Windows and Doors € €. 449,466 4 years 893,571 1,300,000 Relocation of CNWQR residents, shu € 962.559 2024 CNWOR PH 3 DECANT & ENABLING 2.750.247 3.000.000 2018/2019 Voids € TBC 6,832,706 9,219,607 VOID PROGRAMME 2019/2018 87,078 VOIDS PROG 2021 ADVANCE WORKS 2021 Voids €. €. 326,555 TBC 1,246,304 1,300,000 TBC **VOIDS PROG 2022 CONTRACT WORKS** 2022 Voids €. € 3,722,659 3,722,659 4,000,000 Ongoing OLD WHITECHURCH RD INFRASTRUCT LIHAF Infrastructure Project 75.635 13.493.403 13.500.000 € 32,904,093 32,904,093 OLD WHITECHURCH RD NA PIARSAIG Site for Social and Affordable Housin € Phased Delivery from 2023 CNWQR PH 3B Planned dev 62 units €. £ 231,259 2025 591,551 9,498,000 HOLLYWOOD ESTATE INFILL HSG Dev 87units € 262,587 2024 303,217 2,632,827 € € COMP DIALOGUE - SPRING LANE Dev 8 units 994.030 Jul-23 2.341.298 2.646.075 Oct-23 COMP DIALOGUE - GLEN RYAN RD Dev of 9 units € € 551,872 1,616,845 6,433,424 COMP DIALOGUE - COACH STREET € £ 2023 2,188,362 Dev of 13 units 1,203,233 3,826,955 32 UNITS WESTSIDE, MODEL FM RD Dev 43 units € € 306,985 Q4 2024 2,356,230 18,778,722 60 UNITS POULAVONE. BALLINCOLL Dev 60 units € 767.856 Jul-24 3.443.790 23.572.799 37 UNITS WATERCOURSE RD Dev 37 units € € 6.848.958 Early 2023 3.627.268 11.646.930 € 43 UNITS DENROCHES CROSS, CORK €. 7,614,564 Oct-23 9,792,991 Dev 43 units 14,184,500 Dev 27 SOC (AHB) & 27 AFFORDABLE 15,106,342 15,200,000 MIDDLE GLANMIRE RD AFFORD HSG € 4,161,703 - Dec 2022 in defects period SHP 2015-2017 - 32 UNITS BARRACK STRE Dev 32 units 3.040.913 Dec-23 6.309.531 9.392.106 SHP 2015 -17 - 16 UNITS WOOD STREET Dev 16 units € € 129.016 Dec-24 1.444.281 4.626.115 PHASE 2C DEVELOPMENT CNWRQ € €. Dev 24 units 227,943 Ongoing 4,108,707 6,994,140 **BOHERBOY ROAD HSNG SCHEME** Dev of Affordable Housing € € 6,412,861 - Ongoing 10,348,387 11,000,000 € 10.668.816 ERRIGAL HEIGHTS. THE GLEN Dev 28 units 378.610 Nov-24 570.141 GLENAMOY LAWN, MAYFIELD Dev 3 units € € 53.330 Sep-23 85.471 1.004.700 REVOLVING FUND VACANT HSE. REP Revolving Fund €. €. 614,139 Ongoing 2,511,216 2,800,000 € 2,984,807 May-25 19,245,537 50 UNITS BOYCES STREET Dev 51 units € 5,045,838 40 UNITS GERALD GRIFFIN ST 55.767 Ongoing 6.277.880 10,756,119 Dev 49 units FAIRFIELD MEADOW REMEDIATION 19 Remedial Works to Fairfield Meadow € 492,770 TBC 492,770 825.000 SOCIAL HOUSING ACQUISITIONS Purchased houses €. 7,884,705 Rolling 7,884,705

Rolling

16,202

675,000

TAKING IN CHARGE

Limited works for Taking in charge ce €

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current) Capital Expenditure Amount **Current Expenditure** in Reference Year (Non Capital Expenditure Amount | Project/Programme **Cumulative Expenditure to-Projected Lifetime** Explanatory Project/Scheme/Programme Name Short Description Amount in Reference Year in Reference Year (Grant) Anticipated Timeline date Expenditure (Capital Only) Notes Housing & Building CALF Capital Acquisitions Leasing Facility € 12.781.823 € Rolling € 12.781.823 € CAS Capital Assistance Scheme € € 542.008 Rolling € 10.692.929 € ELTON WOOD & HERBERT LAWN € 2023 Turnkey Acquisition € 1.396.169 2.716.140 Dev 54 units € 10.052.582 19,307,527 54 UNITS FORMER BOLAND MILLS Aug-23 € 16,065,118 35 UNITS ARDROSTIG AFFORD HSG Dev 35 units € Oct-23 € 11.054.961 11.157.307 29 UNITS ARDROSTIG AFFORD HSG Dev 29 units €. 6,038,652 2023 8,108,442 11,370,224 €. LOAN SCHEME-TRAVELLERS-CARAVAN €. 669,383 951,263 1,000,000 Loan Scheme Caravans Ongoing 43 UNITS BALLINGLANNA GLANMIRE Part V Turnkey Acquisition €. 2,349,219 2023 € 9,011,158 9,500,000 2025 € 497,251 13,599,538 **CNWQR PH 4A** Design and construction of 62 social I 268,168 2 UNITS FOYLE AVE-INFILL Design and construction of 2 social he 2023 203,054 1,055,601 57,757 MADONNA HSE PH 2 BALLINCOLLIG Dev 6 units 131,164 Sep-24 € 147,048 1,945,320 LIOS CARA KILEENS 44 UNITS Development of 44 housing units € 2.041.497 Jan-24 € 2.041.497 15.917.996 COMP DIALOGUE 21-22 DOMINICK S Development of 9 housing units € 409.206 Jun-24 € 409.206 3.177.288 2.046.877 2,046,877 11,253,600 CHURCH RD BL/ROCK 30 UNITS Development of 30 housing units € Nov-23 € SOC HSG - BESSBOROUGH RD SITE 84 Social Apartments, 6 houses € 430.973 Q4 2024 € 2.728.677 € 36,846,559 36 AFFORD UNIT COOLFLUGH TOWER 36 Affordable Housing € 4.865.992 2024 € 6.277.880 8.000.000 9 UNITS MAISON VERE SAWMILL ST Purchase of 9 housing units € 2.856.170 2022 € 2.856.170 2,856,170 € Road Transportation & Safety 755,039 B01 NP ROAD - MAINTENANCE & IMPRO\Maintenance & Improvement of Nati € BO3 REGIONAL ROAD - MAIN&IMPROVE | Maintenance & Improvement of Reg € 1,803,541 € **B04 LOCAL ROAD - MAIN&IMPROVE** 24,350,874 Maintenance & Improvement of Loca € **B05 PUBLIC LIGHTING** Public Lighting Operations 6,044,524 Traffic Management and Maintenand € € **B06 TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT IMPROVE** 6.633.964 B08 ROAD SAFETY PROMO/EDUCATION School Wardens & Support Costs € 1.112.764 € € **B09 CAR PARKING** Maintenance and Management of Ca € 5.999.128 € B10 SUPPORT TO ROADS CAPITAL PROG Administration of Roads Capital Prog € 3,158,629 € REBURBISHMENT OF CAR PARKS Refurb carparks € € 2023 € 142.586 1.700.000 817.836 2023 AUTOMATIC BOLLARDS restrict pedestrian streets € € 283.473 2.065.000 MONAHAN ROAD EXTENSION Monahan road €. 59,244 Jun-23 €. 408,776 4,400,000 SOUTH DOUGLAS ROAD South Douglas Road Repairs € 1,985,918 Q3 2022 € 2,060,520 1,050,000 SKEHARD RD PHASE 3 1,366,227 2023 € 4,372,364 € 4,000,000 Skehard Road Phase 3 € B&C PUBLIC REALM-INFRASTRUCTURE Public Realm Improvements €. 266,370 Q1 2024 € 772,165 13,843,000 DONNYBROOK HILL PEDESTRIAN SCH Pedestrian Upgrade Works €. 34,566 04 2023 € 77,051 500.000 LEHENAGHMORE ROAD IMPROVEMENTS Road upgrade 488,724 Q4 2022 € 831,679 1,980,000 GLEN DEPOT CONSTRUCTION WORKS Upgrade works to Depot in the Glen € 528.713 528.713 € 587.612 € 2023 to 2025 KNAPPS SQUARE CYCLE ROUTE Cycle Route € 511.856 € 511.856 1.000.000 2023 to 2025 ROCHESTOWN 2 DOUGLAS CYCLE SCH Cycle Route € € 102.540 € 102.540 6.905.000 GLANMIRE TO CITY CYCLE PHASE 2 € 112.690 2025 to 2025 € 112.690 4.760.000 Cvcle Route 812.000 TRAMORE V.P. CYCLE/PATH UPGRAD € 352.393 2023 to 2025 € 352.393 Cycle Route PEDESTR SAFETY IMPROVEMT PH 2 Improve pedestrian and vulnerable i €. 512,841 Jun-23 €. 1,252,134 500.000 **BALLYBRACK PED & CYCLE TRACK** Ballybrack Valley Pedestrian and Cyc € 106,162 2025 € 252,443 PASSAGE GWAY P2 MAHON-PASSAGE Provision of lighting and landscaping € 203,483 Q4 2025 621,913 MCCURTAIN STREET PTI MacCurtain Street Public Transport Ir € 6,521,162 Q4 2023. 9,154,554 9,422,026

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)

		Current Evnenditure	Capital Expenditure Amount	Conital Europeditura America	Drainet / Dragramma	Cumulativa Evnanditura ta	Drainstad Lifeting	Evalonat :
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)	Explanatory Notes
Road Transportation & Safety	Short bescription	Amount in Reference Tear	Grant)	in Reference Tear (Grant)	Anticipated fillieline	uate	Experiulture (capital Only)	Notes
DOCKLANDS TO CITY CENTRE JUNCT	Cork Docklands Road Network Impro	€ -	€ 13,788	f -	2025	€ 511.913	€ 6,250,000	
BALLYVOLANE PH 2 FOX & HOUNDS	Improved walking and cycle environ		€ 205.290	€ -	2023	€ 503.698	€ 200.000	
GLANMIRE ROADS IMPRVMT SCHEME	Improved walking and cycle environ		€ 5,802,857	€ -	2024		,	
DOUGLAS EAST WEST LINK	Provision of approx 180 linear metre	f -	€ 109.995	f -	2024	€ 109,995	€ -	
CURRAGH ROAD UPGRADE SCHEME	Road upgrade	€ -	€ 901.582	€ -	Feb-24		€ 1,300,000	
L2998 DUNKETTLE RD STH (P9B)	Improved walking and cycle environ	~	€ 35,672	€ -	2025	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	€ 800,000	
BLARNEY VILLAGE CYCLE ROUTE	Improved walking and cycle environ		€ 143.096	€ -	2027	€ 143,096	€ -	
MAYFIELD TO GLEN CYCLE ROUTE	Improved walking and cycle environ		€ 42.499	f -	2024		€ -	
GLANMIRE TO CITY CYCLE PHASE 1	Upgrade ped facilities from Dunkettl		€ 168.594	<u> </u>	End 2024	€ 207,958	€ 4,000,000	
MARINA PROMENADE PED/CYCLE	Creation of a continuous wide prome	€ -	€ 149.281		Q3 2024	€ 178,309	£ -	
CURRAHEEN RD CYCLE LANE	Provision of cycle lanes	f -	€ 3,936	£ -	Q3 2024	€ 24,785	f -	
2022 REPAIR OF 4 BRIDGES	Repair of Clash Road Bridge, Myrtle H	<u> </u>	€ 5,930	€ -	Q3 2022 - in defects stage	€ 609,135	€ 652,100	
BANDUFF ROAD SCHEME	Project is to provide safe, high qualit		€ 52,275	€ -	Q3 2022 III delects stage	€ 59,655	£ -	
MAGLIN GREENWAY PHASE 1	Development of 1.4km greenway lin		€ 5.160	£ -	Dec-24		f -	
CARRIGROHANE BRIDGE REPLACEMT	Replacement of Carrigrohane Bridge		€ 268,643	Č	Q3 2022	€ 268,643	£ -	
RAPID DEPLOYMENT PED SCHEME 22	Project is to deliver a significantly im		€ 208,043	f -	Q3 2023	€ 208,043 € 749,905	£ -	
BESSBORO TO MAHON CYCLE & WALK	Project is to deliver a significantly im		€ 3.014	€ -	2026	7 15/505	f -	
SARSFIELD RD TO CLASHDUV	Project is to deliver a significantly im		€ 3,014	f -	2026	-7-	€ -	
SAKSITELD KD TO CLASITDOV	r toject is to deliver a significantly in	-	4,633	-	2020	4,855	-	
Water Services								
C01 WATER SUPPLY	Water plants & networks and suppor	€ 6,001,299	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
C02 WASTE WATER TREATMENT	Waste water treatment costs	€ 3,290,321	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
		-,,-	-	-		-	-	
Development Management								
D01 FORWARD PLANNING	Statutory Plans and Policy costs	€ 2,179,531	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D02 DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT	Planning control costs	€ 3,118,334	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D03 ENFORCEMENT	Planning Enforcement expenditire	€ 882,813	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D05 TOURISM DEVELOPMENT&PROMOTI	Tourism Promotion costs	€ 1,285,106	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D06 COMMUNITY&ENTERPRISE FUNCTIO	General community & enterprise exp	€ 13,063,783	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D08 BUILDING CONTROL	Building Control costs	€ 578,190	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D09 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT&PROMC	Economic development and Enterpri	€ 3,970,684	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
D11 HERITAGE&CONSERVATION SERVICE	Heritage & conservation costs	€ 531,945	€ -	€ -		€ -	€ -	
PURCHASE OF PROPERTY @ KIFTS LANE	Purchase of property	€ -	€ -	€ -	Until development comm	€ 2,752,393	€ 2,752,393	
SITE @ KINSALE RD/M BARRY ROAD	Purchase of site	€ -	€ -	€ -	Until development comm	€ 1,014,749	€ 1,014,749	
KYRLS QUAY/CORNMARKET ST	Brownfield site	€ -	€ -	€ -	Until development comm		€ 2,750,000	
INCHIGAGGIN HOUSE AND LANDS	Purchase of property	€ -	€ -	€ -	Until development comm	€ 2,801,431	€ 2,300,000	
SCIENCE PARK	Development of science park	€ -	€ 165,234	€ -	2021-2024			
DOCKLANDS - PLANNING, STRATEGY	Master Planning, Strategies and Wor	€ -	€ 100,438	€ -	Q1 2025			
CORK DOCKLANDS DELIVERY OFFICE	Establishment of Capital Delivery Off	€ -	€ 148,201	€ -	Q4 2027		€ 10,350,000	
URBAN ANIMATION PROJECT	Outdoor public art trail	€ -	€ 57,825	€ -	Q4 2023	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	€ 670,000	
CORK WAYFINDING SYSTEM	Pedestrian wayfinding	f -	€ 94.079	f -	Q3 2023		€ 1,200,000	

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current) Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Current Expenditure Capital Expenditure Amount Project/Programme Cumulative Expenditure to-**Projected Lifetime** Explanatory Project/Scheme/Programme Name **Short Description** Amount in Reference Year in Reference Year (Grant) **Anticipated Timeline** Expenditure (Capital Only) Notes **Environmental Services** E01 LANDFILL OPERATION & AFTERCARE Landfill Tramore Valley Park 1,898,904 Rolling - Current Exp E02 RECOVERY&RECYC FACILITIES OPS Recycling expenditure 1,477,883 € Rolling - Current Exp € € E06 STREET CLEANING € 7.835.934 € € Street Cleaning € Rolling - Current Exp E07 WASTE REGULATION, MONITORING & Waste Enforement/ Litter 791,760 € € Rolling - Current Exp € € E08 WASTE MANAGEMENT PLANNING € 648,778 € Rolling - Current Exp € € Waste Management Planning 2,229,613 Rolling - Current Exp € E09 MAINTENANCE OF BURIAL GROUNDS Burial Grounds € € € **E10 SAFETY OF STRUCTURES & PLACES** Safe Structures Exp. €. 1,326,583 €. Rolling - Current Exp € €. E11 OPERATION OF FIRE SERVICE Operation of Fire Services 18,402,579 Rolling - Current Exp € **E12 FIRE PREVENTION** € € € € Fire Prevention 2.099.109 Rolling - Current Exp 590,227 € Rolling - Current Exp € € € ELECTRICITY GEN. AT KINSALE RD Generation of electricity at Kinsale R € 77,229 € Ongoing, until gas runs out 1,299,441 1,300,000 DOUGLAS FLOOD RELIEF Flood Relief Scheme € 5.732.006 Q4 2022 € 19.462.234 € 19.775.400 GLASHABOY FLOOD RELIEF SCHEME € € 577.818 € 2026 € Flood Relief Scheme 1.044.488 19.900.000 MORRISONS ISL PUB RE&FLOOD DEF Flood Relief Scheme € € 243,398 € 2024 € 243,398 7,500,000 Recreation and Amenity € F01 LEISURE FACILITIES OPERATIONS Leisure Pool facilities 1.209.307 Rolling - Current Exp € € F02 OP OF LIBRARY&ARCHIVE SERVICE 9,917,713 Rolling - Current Exp Library & Archive € € € F03 OUTDOOR LEISURE AREA OPERATION Outdoor Leisure e.g. Golf Course 12.609.931 Rolling - Current Exp F04 COMM.SPORT&REC DEVELOPMENT Community & Sports € 1.556.597 Rolling - Current Exp € € F05 OPERATION OF ARTS PROGRAMME Arts Programme 3,610,968 Rolling - Current Exp € €. DEVELOPMENT OF MARINA PARK Phase Development of Major City Park in th € 389.970 € 546.535 € 2.700.000 Upgrades work to public park BISHOP LUCEY PARK 228.438 € Dec-23 € 228.438 1.500.000 PASSAGE GWAY P1 MARINA PARK Greenway from Marina Park to Maho € € 4,682,005 € Q4 2023 € 8,006,240 € 8,000,000 GRANGE ROAD TO TRAMORE VALLEY PAR Overhead Bridge Linking to Tramore € 3,142,937 € 2023 € 3,142,937 € 8,000,000 Miscellaneous Services H03 ADMINISTRATION OF RATES 8,641,790 € Rolling - Current Exp Rates division € - |€ €. H05 OP OF MORGUE&CORONER EXP Coroner expenditure 1,237,787 € Rolling - Current Exp € €. H09 LOCAL REPRES/CIVIC LEADERSHIP Local Rep. Expenditure 1,951,206 € € Rolling - Current Exp € € H11 AGENCY & RECOUPABLE SERVICES Annual Contribution Cork County Cor€ 13,981,877 € €. Rolling - Current Exp € 57,000,000 **EVENTS CENTRE** Development of event Centre €. €. 94,618 2024 € 1,483,718 PURCHASE OF NEW EQUIP-FIRE BRI Purchase of New Equipment € 1.074.505 € 2023 € 1,074,505 6,103,000

137,643,316 €

259,211,970 €

Totals

326,133,693 €

648,264,579

Projects/Programmes Completed or discontinued in the reference year - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)							
	Projects	s/Programmes Completed or disco	ntinued in the reference year - Gre	ater than €0.5m (Capital and Curre	nt)		
		Current Expenditure Amount in	Capital Expenditure Amount in	Capital Expenditure Amount in	Project/Programme		
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Reference Year	Reference Year (Non Grant)	Reference Year (Grant)	Completion Date	Final Outturn Expenditure	Explanatory Notes
Housing & Building							
Comp Dialogue - Shanakiel Rd	20 Units	€ -	€ 2,777,438	€ -	31/12/2022	€ 6,305,030	
Comp Dialogue - Skehard Rd	16 Units	€ -	€ 2,318,619	€ -	30/09/2022	€ 5,585,170	
Classis, Pouladuff Rd	11 units	€ -	€ 1,552,202	€ -	31/12/2022	€ 3,540,721	
Sunview Douglas	25 units	€ -	€ 5,507,310	€ -	31/12/2022	€ 8,243,331	
Farranferrris Crescent	5 units	€ -	€ -	€ -	30/09/2022	€ 1,173,965	
29/30 Lower John St	17 units	€ -	€ 59,000	€ -	31/12/2021	€ 4,756,345	
7-11 Gerald Griffin Street	13 Units	€ -	€ 368,888	€ -	30/04/2022	€ 3,940,987	
Churchfield Place	3 units	€ -	€ 788	€ -	31/07/2019	€ 767,755	
CNWQR Ph 2A Decant & Enabling	Regen project	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 1,434,090	
CNWQR Ph 2A Enabling	Regen project	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 516,518	
CNWQR Ph 2A Decant & Design & Construct	Regen project	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 12,947,472	
CNWQR Ph 2B Decant & Enabling	Regen project	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 1,892,189	
EDEL HOUSE, GRATTAN STREET	Construction of 37no. Units - Home	€ -	€ 832,534	€ -	2022	€ 7,537,429	
VOID PROG 2020 - JULY STIMULUS	Voids 2020	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 4,869,631	
ELTON WOOD & HERBERT LAWN	Turnkey Acquisition	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 2,716,140	
DEEP RETROFIT PRG - PEARSE RD&	Energy Efficiency Works Apt. Deep	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 2,484,582	
STOCK CONDITION SURVEY	Social Housing Stock Condition Sur	€ -	€ -	€ -	2022	€ 12,004	
Road Transportation & Safety							
NTA JULY JOBS STIMULUS FT/PATH	Supports for Pandemic	€ -	£	f -	2022	€ 1,300,000	
PUB TRANSPORT ASSET RENEWAL	Resurfacing Buslanes and footpath		€ 2,459,395	£ -	2022	€ 1,300,000 € 2,705,335	
HARLEY STREET BRIDGE	New Bridge	£ -	€ 28,800	£	2022		
CURRAHEEN-CARRIGROHANE PED/CYC	Pedestrian and Cycle Improvement	€ -	€ 28,800	-	2022		
AIRPORT ROAD	Road upgrade	f -	€ 169,245	£	2022		
AIRFORT ROAD	Rodu upgraue	-	109,243	•	2022	1,344,755	
Development Management							
8&9 PARNELL PLACE	Purchase of property	€ -	€ -	€ -	2021	€ 1,250,000	
Recreation and Amenity							
Marina Park Phase 1	Phase:1 Marina Park	f -	€ 311,978	£	2022	€ 12,657,436	
Half Moon Lane/ South douglas road	Pedestrian Access to Tramore park	€ -	€ 311,978	£	2022		
NTA CYCLE DETECTOR/COUNTING	Installation of cycle detection	f -	£ 22,704		2022	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
INTA CICLE DETECTORY COONTING	mstanation of cycle detection	-	-	E	2022	709,203	
Totals		€ -	€ 16,408,961	€ .		€ 96,199,246	

Appendix 2 Checklists – Assessment of Compliance

Checklist 1 – To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.

	General Obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 1.1	Does the organisation ensure, on an ongoing basis, that appropriate people within the organisation and its agencies are aware of their requirements under the Public Spending Code (incl. through training)?	3	Cork City Council have procedures in place which are in line with the PSC.
Q 1.2	Has internal training on the Public Spending Code been provided to relevant staff?	2	Project Managers are made aware of their responsibilities regarding PSC via internal and on the job training
Q 1.3	Has the Public Spending Code been adapted for the type of project/programme that your organisation is responsible for, i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?	3	Yes
Q 1.4	Has the organisation in its role as Approving Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the Public Spending Code?	N/A	
Q 1.5	Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the organisation and to agencies?	3	Yes, all in-depth check recommendations as they arise are disseminated to the relevant Department and Project Manager via a tracker.
Q 1.6	Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?	2	Recommendations are applied to new projects
Q 1.7	Has an annual Public Spending Code QA report been submitted to and certified by the Chief Executive Officer, submitted to NOAC and published on the Local Authority's website?	3	Yes
Q 1.8	Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?	3	Yes, there were 4 capital projects and 1 Programme subject to in-depth checking
Q 1.9	Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations?		Where post project reviews are a requirement of the sanctioning authority

	Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project.	2	
Q 1.10	How many formal evaluations were completed in the year under review? Have they been published in a timely manner?	2	3 in number
Q 1.11	Is there a process in place to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations?	2	Informal process where Project Managers share recommendations
Q 1.12	How have the recommendations of reviews and ex post evaluations informed resource allocation decisions?	2	Resource allocation decisions take into account previous recommendations

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year.

	Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 2.1	Was a Strategic Assessment Report (SAR) completed for all capital projects and programmes over €10m?	3	Within Housing, this is completed in accordance with HOUSING FOR ALL PLAN requirements. SAR completed for other project over €10m
Q 2.2	Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date? Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	Performance indicators are specified at the outset A tracker sheet, managed by the HOUSING DELIVERY COORDINATION OFFICE (of the LGMA), is used to gather the data.
Q 2.3	Was a Preliminary and Final Business Case, including appropriate financial and economic appraisal, completed for all capital projects and programmes?	3	Capital Appraisals are prepared in accordance with funding agencies
Q 2.4	Were the proposal objectives SMART and aligned with Government policy including National Planning Framework, Climate Mitigation Plan etc?	2	Proposals are made in compliance with any current policy requirements in order to secure funding.
Q 2.5	Was an appropriate appraisal method and parameters used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?	3	Capital Appraisal are required to be prepared in accordance with funding agencies and internal Capital budget procedures
Q 2.6	Was a financial appraisal carried out on all proposals and was there appropriate consideration of affordability?	3	Yes, an appraisal process must be completed before budgets are allocated. Controlled centrally by Finance. Approval Authority makes ultimate decision on Affordability
Q 2.7	Was the appraisal process commenced at an early enough stage to inform decision making?	3	Appraisals are required to be signed off in advance-of any costs are incurred and in line with DHLGH requirements
Q 2.8	Were sufficient options analysed in the business case for each capital proposal?	2	Option Assessment forms part of approval process

Q 2.9	Was the evidence base for the estimated cost set out in each business case?	2	Cost estimates are prepared in accordance
	Was an appropriate methodology used to estimate the cost?		with the DHLGH &
	Were appropriate budget contingencies put in place?		funding agency
Q 2.10		2	requirements. Review meetings with
Q 2.10	Was risk considered and a risk mitigation strategy commenced?	2	funding agencies
	Was appropriate consideration given to governance and deliverability?		addresses these.
Q 2.11	Were the Strategic Assessment Report, Preliminary and Final Business Case	N/A	N/A
	submitted to DPER for technical review for projects estimated to cost over €100m?		
Q 2.12	Was a detailed project brief including design brief and procurement strategy prepared for all investment projects?	3	These form the basis of the Capital Appraisals referred to above. Both elements are documented further outside of the Capital Appraisal format.
Q 2.13	Were procurement rules (both National and EU) complied with?	3	Yes
Q 2.14	Was the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) properly implemented?	3	Yes, as per the requirements of the Sanctioning Authority/ Approving Authority
Q 2.15	Were State Aid rules checked for all support?	3	Yes, where relevant
Q 2.16	Was approval sought from the Approving Authority at all decision gates?	3	Yes
Q 2.17	Was Value for Money assessed and confirmed at each decision gate by		Yes, but improvement
	Sponsoring Agency and Approving Authority?	2	needed in documentation
Q 2.18	Was approval sought from Government through a Memorandum for		
	Government at the appropriate decision gates for projects estimated to cost	N/A	N/A
	over €100m?		
		•	•

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year.

	Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 3.1	Were objectives clearly set out?	3	Set out in the Annual Service Delivery Plan & Budget Process.
Q 3.2	Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?	3	National and local Service Level Indicators in place and are reviewed regularly
Q 3.3	Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal,		This is considered as part
	prepared for new current expenditure proposals?	3	of Annual Statutory Budgetary Process.
Q 3.4	Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	3	Appraised based on competing priorities in Budgetary Process
Q 3.5	Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects/programmes		
	exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.6	Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.7	Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.8	Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.9	Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Vote Section in DPER?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.10	Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.11	Was the required approval granted?	3	Yes, approved by Council under statutory Annual Budget Process
Q 3.12	Has a sunset clause been set?	N/A	N/A
Q 3.13	If outsourcing was involved were both EU and National procurement rules complied with?	N/A	N/A

Q 3.14	Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	3	Yes, performance indicators are assigned to relevant current expenditure and reviewed on a monthly basis by the CE
Q 3.15	Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	National and local Service Level Indicators in place and are reviewed regularly.

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

	Incurring Capital Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 4.1	Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval given at each Decision Gate?	3	Yes
Q 4.2	Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?	2	Yes
Q 4.3	Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?	3	Yes, staff at the appropriate level were given responsibility for specific projects
Q 4.4	Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?	3	Yes, project managers were appointed appropriate to scale of project
Q 4.5	Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?	2	Reports are more formalised during the construction stage and could be improved for the stages prior to construction.
Q 4.6	Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?	2	Yes, generally projects remained within budget however construction inflation did cause cost increases
Q 4.7	Did budgets have to be adjusted?	2	Yes submissions are required to be made to the DHLGH for additional funding to cover the additional costs
Q 4.8	Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?	2	Yes in general they were made within the time limits allowed for in the contracts
Q 4.9	Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)?	3	Yes due to the impact of hyperinflation and supply chain related issues.

Q 4.10	If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/programme/grant scheme was the project subjected to adequate examination?	3	Yes
Q 4.11	If costs increased or there were other significant changes to the project was approval received from the Approving Authority?	1	Yes, approval is sought where necessary but delays in granting of approval
Q 4.12	Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?	N/A	N/A

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

	Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 -3	Comment/Action Required
Q 5.1	Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	Yes. Spending Programme Defined as part of the Annual Budget process which is in line with the Corporate Plan and Service Delivery Plans.
Q 5.2	Are outputs well defined?	2	National KPIs are in place for Local Government. Cork City Council also has local indicators in place
Q 5.3	Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	2	National Service Level Indicators (KPIs) are established annually for specific services. Monthly KPI reports are submitted to Council.
Q 5.4	Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an ongoing basis?	2	Annual reporting on National Service Level indicators. Monthly national and local KPIs reported to Council
Q 5.5	Are outcomes well defined?	2	Well defined for certain Programmes, more subjective for others. Targets are defined in the Annual Budget, Corporate Plan and Service Delivery Plans.
Q 5.6	Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	2	Yes, for major Current Expenditure Programmes. Annual budgets and SPC reporting
Q 5.7	Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	2	Unit costing where appropriate.
Q 5.8	Are other data complied to monitor performance?	2	Yes, for internal reporting purposes.

Q 5.9	Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an ongoing basis?	2	There is a method for certain programmes.
Q 5.10	Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' of programmes/projects?	1	There has been no formal 'evaluation proofing' however data is available to allow for future evaluation.

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued in the year under review.

	Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 6.1	How many Project Completion Reports were completed in the year under review?	2	7
Q 6.2	Were lessons learned from Project Completion Reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	2	For completed reports reviews carried out with Sponsoring Agency.
Q 6.3	How many Project Completion Reports were published in the year under review?	2	5
Q 6.4	How many Ex-Post Evaluations were completed in the year under review?	2	2
Q 6.5	How many Ex-Post Evaluations were published in the year under review?	2	2
Q 6.6	Were lessons learned from Ex-Post Evaluation reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	N/A	N/A
Q 6.7	Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluations carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	2	Yes
Q 6.8	Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluation Reports for projects over €50m sent to DPER for dissemination?	N/A	N/A

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued.

	Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 – 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 7.1	Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?	N/A	
Q 7.2	Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	
Q 7.3	Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	
Q 7.4	Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	
Q 7.5	Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	
Q 7.6	Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	
Q 7.7	Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	

Appendix 3 In-Depth Checks Detailed Reports 2022

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Programme	
Detail	Social Housing Support Scheme	
Responsible Body	Cork City Council	
Current Status	Programme being Incurred	
Start Date	1 st January 2022 (Recurring Annual Expenditure)	
End Date	31 st December 2022 (Recurring Annual Expenditure)	
Overall Cost	€7,400,000	

Project Description

The Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) is a scheme to cater for the accommodation needs of people who are in receipt of Rent Supplement for more than 18 months and who have long-term housing needs. The scheme is administered by Local Authorities who enter contractual arrangements with accommodation providers to secure the medium to long-term availability of private rented accommodation.

RAS provides a more structured, accommodation-based approach to the use of the private rented sector to meet long-term housing need reducing dependence on temporary income support payments, i.e., HAP. Once RAS houses an individual, they are deemed to be in receipt of social housing support and their housing need is met therefore they are no longer on the social housing list.

The key features of RAS are as follows:

- The Local Authority pays the full agreed rent to the landlord on behalf of the tenant.
- The tenant pays to the Local Authority, a differential rent payment which is calculated based on his or her means.
- The Residential Tenancies Act 2004 (as amended), governs the relationship between the landlord and tenant.
- The landlord must be tax compliant.
- The property must meet minimum standards for the scheme as determined by the Local Authority and must also meet additional requirements for RAS.
- The landlord must have registered the tenancy with the Residential Tenancy Board (RTB).
- The tenant is required to remain in the property for 4 years.
- The Local Authority is responsible for carrying out annual reviews of tenants means of income in order to determine what changes if any are needed to the differential rent.
- Tenants are required to contact the local authority if their circumstances change.

HAP has superseded RAS. Cork City Council are not currently seeking new tenants for RAS. The RAS section is managing the current RAS tenancies.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council have completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the RAS programme (current expenditure 'being incurred'). A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
using accommodation based solutions. To ensure the efficient and effective operation of the Rental Accommodation Scheme in Cork City Council	Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH) Programme funding of	The procurement of private rented accommodation available on a longterm basis. To assist eligible people to meet their housing needs through RAS. Submission of departmental returns Timely rent reviews	Support the housing needs of people through the RAS scheme. The ongoing management of 878 RAS tenancies for 2022. Number people and properties transferred to RAS.	Facilitate a social mix by providing a wider geographical spread of social housing. Improved quality of private rented accommodation Reducing the number of people on Cork City Council social housing list

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives:

The principal objective of the Rental Accommodation Scheme is to provide high standard accommodation for people who are in receipt of Rent Supplement for more than 18 months and who have long-term housing needs. A further objective is to provide security of tenure in good quality accommodation for eligible tenants in the private rented sector. It is an objective of Cork City Council's Housing Section to administer the scheme in an efficient and effective manner for the benefit of all stakeholders in the process.

Inputs:

The primary input to the programme is the funding of €6.1m. This is through Recoupment from the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH) based on the number of active RAS tenancies. Other Inputs of the RAS project include housing stock from the private rental sector. A dedicated team in the Housing Directorate in Cork City Council are responsible for the administration of the scheme and the review of housing stock for Cork City.

Activities:

The key activities in the delivery of this programme include:

- Securing the RAS properties and guide private landlords on entering the RAS scheme.
- Advising and assisting eligible people on how to meet their housing needs through RAS
- Robust financial management of scheme.
- Completion of timely rent reviews
- Engagement with tenants and landlords

Outputs:

The output of the scheme is measured by the fact that as of December 2022, Cork City Council is supporting the housings need of 878 tenants through RAS.

Outcomes:

The outcome of the programme includes:

- Facilitate a social mix by providing a wider geographical spread of social housing.
- Improved quality of private rented accommodation.
- Improved tenant choice through the creation of a graduated system of housing supports.
- Reduce the number of people on Cork City Councils social housing list.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the RAS Programme from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones:

2004	Commencement of RAS Programme – transfer of long-term rent supplement recipients to RAS	
2022	The ongoing management of over 800 tenancies in 2022. Monthly: Landlord Payments	
	Monthly: Returns submitted to the Department of Housing.	
	Annual: Return to the Revenue Commissioners of rents paid to landlords	

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the Operation of the RAS Programme.

Project/Programme Key Documents		
Title	Details	
Rental Accommodation Scheme – General Overview of Scheme	Background, objectives, and benefits of RAS. It includes the relevant funding, management, and contractual arrangements	
Circular 39 of 2019	Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Revised Recoupment Arrangements for 2020	
Tenant files	Containing details of RAS tenant checklist, rent calculations, rent reviews, and completed contract documents	
Landlord files	Containing details of landlord checklist, landlord details, building inspection completed, rent calculations, commencement date and proof of ownership, contracts	
Monthly management reports to Council	Reporting on the number of active tenancies is included in monthly management reports for the Council	
Financial Reports	Reports generated from JD Edwards detailing the expenditure and income.	
Recoupment Reports	Reports detailing the recoupment of funding from the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage.	

Key Document 1: Rental Accommodation Scheme – General Overview of Scheme

This detailed DHLGH document provides background and objectives of the RAS programme.

Key Document 2: Circular 39 of 2019

Rental Accommodation Scheme (RAS) Revised Recoupment Arrangements for 2022.

Key Document 3: Tenant files

Containing details of RAS tenant checklist, rent calculations, rent reviews, and completed contract documents. Overall, the quality of the data contained in the sample of files reviewed was satisfactory.

Key Document 4: Landlord files

Containing details of RAS Landlord Checklist, landlord details, building inspection reports, agreed rent, commencement date and proof of ownership was reviewed. Overall, the quality of the data contained in the sample of files reviewed was satisfactory.

Key Document 5: Monthly management reports to Council

Reporting on the number of active RAS tenancies is included in monthly management reports for the Council.

Key Document 8: Financial Reports

Monthly reports detailing rents paid to Landlords, rents invoiced to tenants, tenant rent arrears and amounts to be claimed from the department of Housing. Costs are tracked against budget and details regarding variances are communicated to the Finance Dept. These are available to view on file.

Key Document 9: Recoupment Reports

These reports are submitted to the DHLGH monthly and contain end of year financial and activity returns. In addition, the RAS unit prepare a yearly reconciliation. These are available to view on file.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the RAS Programme. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability	
Sample of 83 RAS tenant files	To review activity in accordance with the terms and conditions of the scheme to ensure compliance	Readily available from the RAS Section	
Sample of 88 Landlord files	To review activity in 2022 to ensure compliance	Readily available from the RAS Section	
Financial Data	Check compliance with the scheme parameters. Confirm rates and timing of payments and recoupments.	Readily available from the RAS Section	
Monthly and Annual Returns	Check compliance with the scheme	Readily available from the RAS Section	

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The data audit presented above details the type of information that was readily available during this inspection. All RAS files and data reviewed in relation to the operation of the RAS Programme were made available at the time of audit.

It is the opinion of Internal Audit that Cork City Council RAS Programme is collecting relevant data that will enable continued evaluation of the programme.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the "RAS Programme" based on findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The Rental Accommodation Scheme forms part of Cork City Council's annual current expenditure programme.

The appraisal stage is addressed through the assessment procedures for prospective tenants, prospective landlords and the review properties in question. Applications for the RAS scheme are individually assessed to ensure that the property is suitable for the tenant's needs and that the property meets the current requirements in Minimum Rented Standards.

The implementation and on-going day to day administration of the scheme is governed by administrative and financial procedures which ensure the productive and efficient application of the scheme.

It is Internal Audit's opinion that the processes and procedures in place, both administrative and financial, provide satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

The necessary data and information are available to facilitate a full evaluation on the scheme. Appropriate assessment procedures are in place to assess prospective tenants' participation in the scheme, and files are maintained to support this process. Each RAS recipient and landlord must return data to the RAS Office prior to funding payment. All data in respect of the RAS tenancies examined is available on file, such as tenant Rent calculations and garda checks. All data in respect of each landlord that participates in the RAS scheme is available to review on file. Chief Executive monthly reports for RAS tenancy management and tenancy procurement are available to view on file. Financial data is available on JD Edwards, the financial management system to carry out a financial evaluation.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

The following actions are proposed by the Internal Audit team to enhance and strengthen the processes and management currently in place.

- We recommend that CCC RAS adhere to the procedure to ensure that rent reviews are completed annually.
- We recommend that CCC RAS implement a system to ensure that tenancies are registered with the Residential Tenancies Board (RTB).

Arrears cases can be difficult to manage. Cork City Council is prepared to negotiate in these circumstances and will enter into agreements with the tenant regarding a schedule of payments designed to address the arrears. In the main, arrears cases are being monitored satisfactorily, however the importance of early intervention cannot be over-emphasised.

Section C: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the RAS Programme 2022.

Summary of In-Depth Check

Internal Audit Staff had meetings with RAS staff and viewed a number of key documents and reviewed a sample of data in relation to RAS. Internal Audit took a sample of 83 RAS tenant files and 88 RAS landlord files from 2022. Appropriate procedures governing the scheme are in place covering areas such as applications, assessments, receipts, payments, and recoupment of rents.

This Programme was categorised as current expenditure being incurred in the 2022 public spending code quality assurance inventory listing. The objective of the RAS programme is to provide social housing support to cater for the accommodation needs of people who are in receipt of long-term rent supplement. There are several documents that define the objectives of the Programme, Cork City Council's Annual Service Delivery Plan 2022, Annual Budget 2022, City Council's Corporate Plan to 2024. There is also evidence of planning and monitoring of the RAS programme expenditure through the Annual Budget 2022, JDEdwards financial reports and monitoring reports.

The staff responsible for administering the RAS scheme perform a task with many elements, complexities, and difficulties. A great deal of time and effort is directed to dealing with the more qualitative aspects of the scheme, i.e., tenants, landlords.

Having completed our review, it is Internal Audit's opinion that the financial and administrative procedures offer satisfactory assurance of being in compliance with the public spending code.

Quality Assurance - In Depth Check Church Road Housing Development

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Church Road Housing Development	
Detail	Capital investment programme to develop 30 social housing units on Church Road, Cork	
Responsible Body	Cork City Council	
Current Status	Expenditure Being Incurred	
Start Date	June 2021	
End Date	December 2023	
Overall Cost	€11,253,600	

Project Description

The project comprises of the development of thirty new dwellings of one- and two-bedroom units at Church Road, Cork. It is intended that all the units will be utilised for the provision of social housing for applicants from the Social Housing list supporting Cork City Council's Social Housing delivery plan.

In the Church Road area at the time of appraisal, the housing waiting list for Social Housing stood at 2,441 applicants. This broke down into applications for 57 four bed dwellings, 375 three bed, 876 two beds and 1,119 one-bedroom dwellings.

The development at Church Road consists of 6 one-bedroom units and 24 two-bedroom units.

Background

This proposed scheme forms part of the ongoing Competitive Dialogue 'Cork City Council Housing Programme 2021-2023' public procurement process and is a major part of Cork City Council's delivery plan for Rebuilding Ireland as approved by Government in July 2016.

The Council invites proposals from Candidates which can deliver social, affordable, or mixed tenure schemes, to include new build construction, conversion of existing buildings, or a scheme which forms part of a larger development.

Through the Competitive Dialogue procedure, the Council engages with Candidates to identify and define the best means suited to meeting its requirements whether by means of solutions such as the:

- provision of suitable sites, carrying out design and obtaining appropriate planning permissions in partnership with the Council and delivery of housing schemes on selected sites.
- delivery of housing schemes to be ready for occupation by residents under a parallel site Acquisition and Development Agreements with the Council entitled the *Cork City Council* Housing Programme 2021-23.
- completion and transfer of suitable existing unfinished housing schemes.
- provision of suitable sites with valid planning permission for a housing development and delivery of such a development.
- delivery of additional units in existing housing schemes.
- delivery and transfer of suitably refurbished housing.
- conversion of existing residential, non-residential, commercial, and industrial buildings to deliver suitable housing.

The Church Road development is one of a number of schemes that was shortlisted through the dialogue process. The scheme (alternatives, constraints, costs/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor.

Current Status

On the 19th of October 2022, a Chief Executive order was made for the purchase of the site at Church Road. On the 16th of November 2022, a Chief Executive order was made to enter into a Project Agreement with the developer, Lyonshall and construction commenced in December 2022. The expected completion date is December 2023.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth check, Cork City Council have completed a Programme Logic Model(PLM) for the Church Road Housing Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
Deliver new social housing units to	Capital funding provided by the	Competitive Dialogue Process.	The development of 30 dwelling units	•
support the CCC	Department of	Dialogue Process.	in Church Road,	to deliver new
Housing Program 2021-2023 which	Housing, Local Government and	Independent Valuation.	Cork City.	social housing units in response
forms a key part of	Heritage.	valuation.		to the demand that
the Rebuilding		Tender process,		exists for the
Ireland Government	Site at Church Road.	review, selection, and award.		Blackrock area of the city, reducing
Programme.				the numbers on
	Cork City Council			Cork City Council's
Provide housing to	Staff and	parcels of land that		housing waiting list
meet guidelines for the development	resources.	make up the site.		and supporting the Rebuilding Ireland
of Quality	External	Project		Government
Sustainable	Consultants &	Management.		Programme.
Communities.	Contractors.			
		Recoupment of		
		Capital Grant.		

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objectives of the housing development are to deliver thirty social housing units to support the CCC Housing Program 2021-2023. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the Blackrock area of the city.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding of €11,253,600 approved by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage. The cumulative expenditure to the end of 2022 is €2,046,877.

Activities: There are a number of key activities being carried out throughout the project including:

- Competitive Dialogue Process.
- Independent Valuation.
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage.
- Tendering for the suitable developers, review, and award of contracts.
- Purchase of the parcel of land that make up the site.
- Construction of dwelling units.
- Project management and administration of contracts.

Outputs: The expected outputs of the project are thirty high quality dwellings with a mix of one- and two-bedroom apartments.

- 6 one-bedroom apartments
- 24 two-bedroom apartments

Outcomes: The envisaged outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units of high quality to support the Rebuilding Ireland Government Programme. In the Blackrock area of the city, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These thirty units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – Church Road from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

,	June 2021	Request to participate in Competitive Dialogue Process initiated.
	June 2021	Suitability Assessment Questionnaire Reports reviewed and short listing of candidates completed.
	July 2021	Invitation to Participate in Dialogue process completed, assessment report issued with preferred bidder.
	Dec 2021	Quantity surveyors report on project delivery costs.
	January 2022	Independent Valuation of Church Road site.
	February 2022	Dialogue phase for Lots 2B closed.
	February 2022	Capital Appraisal and DHLGH Stage 1,2 $\&$ 3 submitted to the DHLGH for approval.
	April 2022	DHLGH Stage 1,2&3 Approval
	July 2022	Deadline for receipt of Tender
	October 2022	CE Order approved for purchase of site at Church Road and appointment of Developer.
	November 2022	Contract Awarded
	December 2022	On site commencement
7	December 2023	Substantial Completion

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the Church Road Development.

Project/Programme Key Documents			
Title	Details		
Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan	Outlines the key services intended to be Delivered to the Cork City public and businesses during 2022.		
Capital Appraisal for Church Road	Appraisal document for the development at Church Road, Cork.		
Valuation Report	Independent valuation report of the development at Church Road, Cork.		
Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage	Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework.		
Procurement Documents	Competitive Dialogue procurement and tender process documents.		
Deeds of Properties at Church Road	Deeds of property at Church Road.		

Key Document 1: Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan

The Annual Service Delivery Plan is an essential component in delivering the Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 as required by section 50 of the Local Government Reform Act 2014. Cork City Council produces an Annual Service Delivery Plan each year following the adoption of its annual budget to plan its activities for the year ahead. It identifies the key services that Cork City Council intends to deliver to the people and businesses of Cork City. The Operational Plan includes the social housing provision target for each year.

Key Document 2: Capital Appraisal for Development of Church Road, Cork.

The appraisal detailed the following:

- Analysis of Housing Need the need for social housing within the Blackrock area of Cork City.
- Design Brief an outline of the proposed development of thirty dwellings.
- Site Selection assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Project Management Arrangements details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project.
- Initial Cost Estimates preliminary budget estimate for the development.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council's stage 1 submission to the DHLGH.

Key Document 3: Valuation Report

The Independent Valuation was conducted by external valuers in January 2022. The valuers formed their opinion based on evidence from actual transactions and quoting prices of properties on the market at the time.

Key Document 4: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage approval for the development with a budget of €11,253,600.

Key Document 5: Procurement Documents

In June 2021, Cork City Council launched a competitive dialogue procurement procedure to engage with suitable candidates to identify solutions and opportunities to deliver Cork City Council's Social Housing Programme. The Invitation to Submit a Tender for Lot 2B of the 'Cork City Council Social Housing Programme 2021-23' was issued on the 28th of June 2022. Submissions for Lot 2B were received and assessed by the assessment panels against the 'Award Criteria'. Comprehensive documentation relating to the competitive dialogue process and tender evaluation processes is available on file.

Key Document 6: Deeds of Properties

The deeds for the land at Church Road.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the Church Road Housing Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Capital Appraisal Report	Outlines the need for the Project (Housing demand numbers, type of units needed, alternative means of meeting the need, site constraints, planning details, cost and vfm, management arrangements, delivery mechanism proposals, programme.	This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council
Valuation Report	To determine the valuation of the site and subsequent development	Information readily available – Available on file
Project File	Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc	Information readily available – Available on file
Costs associated with the project.	To determine the value of the project	Information readily available – Available on file.

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. The initial costs of the project are clearly identified by capital code and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage since they are the approving body.

The project is still being implemented and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages, there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of Church Road based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

By utilizing the Competitive Dialogue process, the preferred bidder/developer provided the construction site, the development plan with pre-approved planning.

Through the dialogue process, the scheme (alternatives, constraints, costs/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been assessed and agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor. Stages 1, 2 & 3 of the Capital Works Management Framework appraisal (being stage 1. Preliminary business case and stage 2 pre-tender final business case of the PSC code) have all been submitted for approval to the DHLGH at the same time in the process, as the project and associated costs for each stage submission are the same. This satisfies stages 1,2 of the Appraisal stage of the PSC Code. Stage 4 of the CWMF was not submitted for approval as the costs had not changed, following the tender process.

The implementation stage has just commenced in December 2022, therefore Internal Audit is not in a position to provide an opinion.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available on file and through the financial management system to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals. The project is not yet complete and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Regarding the Church Road development project, it is important that the project operates within the Public Spending Code framework.

Internal Audit recommend that CCC ensure to in future submit Stage 4 of the CWMF in order to fully comply with stage 3 of the PSC code.

Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied.

Cork City Council should ensure that all relevant employees are aware of their responsibility with regard to the Public Spending Code.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Church Road Development Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the purchase of land situated at Church Road in the Blackrock area of Cork City and the development of thirty dwelling units with an approved overall budget of €11,253,600. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Church Road Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Finally, to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check Killeens Housing Development

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Killeens Housing Development	
Detail	Capital investment programme to develop 44 social housing units in Killeens, Cork	
Responsible Body	Cork City Council	
Current Status	Expenditure Being Incurred	
Start Date	June 2021	
End Date	January 2024	
Overall Cost	€15,917,996	

Project Description

The project comprises of the development of forty-four new dwellings of two-, three- and four-bedroom units in Killeens, Cork. It is intended that all the units will be utilised for the provision of social housing for applicants from the Social Housing list supporting Cork City Council's Social Housing delivery plan.

In the Killeens area at the time of appraisal, the housing waiting list for Social Housing stood at 59 applicants. That broke down into applications for 3 no. four bed dwellings, 19 no. three bed, 25 no and 12 no. one bedroom dwellings. This development will therefore meet the need of 44.

applicants from that waiting list.

The development of 44 units comprises of 7 two-bedroom units, 32 three-bedroom units and 5 four-bedroom units. The proposal of 44 units achieves a density of 23.4 units per hectare which is consistent with delivering best use of the site.

Background

This proposed scheme forms part of the ongoing Competitive Dialogue 'Cork City Council Housing Programme 2021-2023' public procurement process and is a major part of Cork City Council's delivery plan for Rebuilding Ireland as approved by Government in July 2016.

The Council invites proposals from Candidates which can deliver social, affordable, or mixed tenure schemes, to include new build construction, conversion of existing buildings, or a scheme which forms part of a larger development.

Through the Competitive Dialogue procedure, the Council engages with Candidates to identify and define the best means suited to meeting its requirements whether by means of solutions such as the:

- provision of suitable sites, carrying out design and obtaining appropriate planning permissions in partnership with the Council and delivery of housing schemes on selected sites.
- delivery of housing schemes to be ready for occupation by residents under a parallel site
 Acquisition and Development Agreements with the Council entitled the Cork City Council

Housing Programme 2021-23.

- completion and transfer of suitable existing unfinished housing schemes.
- provision of suitable sites with valid planning permission for a housing development and delivery of such a development.
- delivery of additional units in existing housing schemes.
- delivery and transfer of suitably refurbished housing.
- conversion of existing residential, non-residential, commercial, and industrial buildings to deliver suitable housing.

The Killeens development is one of a number of schemes that were shortlisted through the dialogue process. The scheme (alternatives, constraints, cost/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor.

Current Status

On the 2nd of November 2022, a Chief Executive order was made for the purchase of the site at Killeens. On the 16th of December 2022, a Chief Executive order was made to enter into a Project Agreement with the developer, BMOR Projects and construction commenced in December 2022. The expected completion date is January 2024.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth check, Cork City Council have completed a Programme Logic Model(PLM) for the Killeens Housing Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
Deliver new social	Capital funding	Competitive	The development	The housing
housing units to	provided by the	Dialogue Process.	of 44 dwelling units	project is expected
support the CCC	Department of		in the Killeens area	to deliver new
Housing Program	Housing, Local	Independent	just north of the	social housing
2021-2023 which	Government and	Valuation.	city.	units in response
forms a key part of	Heritage.			to the demand that
the Rebuilding		Tender process,		exists for the
Ireland	Site at Killeens.	review, selection,		Killeens area of the
Government		and award.		city, reducing the
Programme.	Cork City Council			numbers on Cork
	Staff and	Purchase of the		City Council's
Provide housing to	resources.	parcels of land that		housing waiting list
meet guidelines for		make up the site.		and supporting the
the development	External			Rebuilding Ireland
of Quality	Consultants &	Project		Government
Sustainable	Contractors.	Management.		Programme.
Communities.				
		Recoupment of		
		Capital Grant.		

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objectives of the housing development are to deliver forty-four social housing units to support the CCC Housing Program 2021-2023. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the Killeens area of the city.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding of €15,917,996 approved by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage. The cumulative expenditure to the end of 2022 is €2,041,280.13.

Activities: There are a number of key activities being carried out during the project including:

- Competitive Dialogue Process.
- Independent Valuation.
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage.
- Tendering for the suitable developers, review, and award of contracts.
- Purchase of the parcel of land that make up the site.
- Construction of dwelling units.
- Project management and administration of contracts.

Outputs: The expected outputs of the project are forty-four high quality dwellings with a mix of two, three- and four-bedroom houses.

- 7 two-bedroom houses
- 32 three-bedroom houses
 - 5 four-bedroom houses

Outcomes: The envisaged outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units of high quality to support the Rebuilding Ireland Government Programme. In the Killeens area of the city, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These forty-four units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

January 2024

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – Killeens from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

June 2021	Request to participate in Competitive Dialogue Process initiated.
June 2021	Suitability Assessment Questionnaire Reports reviewed and short listing of candidates completed.
July 2021	Invitation to Participate in Dialogue process completed, assessment report issued with preferred bidder.
October 2021	Independent Valuation of Killeens site.
December 2021	Quantity surveyors report on project delivery costs.
December 2021	Capital Appraisal and DHLGH Stage 1, 2 & 3 submission for approval.
February 2022	Dialogue phase for Lots 2B closed.
May 2022	DHLGH Stage 1, 2 & 3 Approval
July 2022	Deadline for receipt of Tender
November 2022	CE Order approving purchase of site and appointment of Developer.
December 2022	Contract Awarded
December 2022	On site commencement

Substantial Completion

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the Killeens Development.

Project/Programme Key Documents		
Title	Details	
Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan	Outlines the key services intended to be delivered to the Cork City public and businesses during 2022.	
Capital Appraisal for site at Killeens, Cork	Appraisal document for the development at Killeens, Cork.	
Valuation Report	Independent valuation report of the development at Killeens, Cork.	
Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage	Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework.	
Procurement Documents	Competitive Dialogue procurement and tender process documents.	
Deeds of Property	Deeds for site at Killeens.	

Key Document 1: Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan

The Annual Service Delivery Plan is an essential component in delivering the Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 as required by section 50 of the Local Government Reform Act 2014. Cork City Council produces an Annual Service Delivery Plan each year following the adoption of its annual budget to plan its activities for the year ahead. It identifies the key services that Cork City Council intends to deliver to the people and businesses of Cork City. The Operational Plan includes the social housing provision target for each year.

Key Document 2: Capital Appraisal for Development at Killeens, Cork.

The appraisal detailed the following:

- Analysis of Housing Need the need for social housing within the Killeens area of Cork City.
- Design Brief an outline of the proposed development of forty-four dwellings.
- Site Selection assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Project Management Arrangements details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project.
- Initial Cost Estimates preliminary budget estimate for the development.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council's stage 1 submission to the DHLGH.

Key Document 3: Valuation Report

The Independent Valuation was conducted by external valuers in October 2021. The valuers formed their opinion based on evidence from actual transactions and quoting prices of properties on the

market at the time.

Key Document 4: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and

Heritage

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage approval for the development with a

budget of €15,917,996.

Key Document 5: Procurement Documents

In June 2021, Cork City Council launched a competitive dialogue procurement procedure to engage with suitable candidates to identify solutions and opportunities to deliver Cork City Council's Social Housing Programme. The Invitation to Submit a Tender for Lot 2B of the 'Cork City Council Social Housing Programme 2021-23' was issued on the 28th of June 2022. Submissions for Lot 2B were received and assessed by the assessment panels against the 'Award Criteria'. Comprehensive documentation relating to the competitive dialogue process and tender evaluation processes is

available on file.

Key Document 6: Deeds of Properties

Deeds for the site at Killeens

Section B – Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the Killeens Housing Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Capital Appraisal Report	Outlines the need for the Project (Housing demand numbers, type of units needed, alternative means of meeting the need, site constraints, planning details, cost and vfm, management arrangements, delivery mechanism proposals, programme.	This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council
Valuation Report	To determine the valuation of the site and subsequent development	Information readily available – Available on file
Project File	Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc	Information readily available – Available on file
Costs associated with the project.	To determine the value of the project	Information readily available – Available on file.

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. The initial costs of the project are clearly identified by capital code and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage since they are the approving body.

The project is still being implemented and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages, there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of Killeens based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

By utilizing the Competitive Dialogue process, the preferred bidder/developer provided the construction site, cost details and the development plan with pre-approved planning.

Through the dialogue process, the scheme (alternatives, constraints, costs/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been assessed and agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor. Stages 1, 2 & 3 of the Capital Works Management Framework appraisal (being stage 1. Preliminary business case and stage 2 pre-tender final business case of the PSC code) have all been submitted for approval to the DHLGH at the same time in the process, as the project and associated costs for each stage submission are the same. This satisfies stages 1,2 of the Appraisal stage of the PSC Code. Stage 4 of the CWMF was not submitted for approval as the costs had not changed, following the tender process.

The implementation stage has just commenced in December 2022, therefore Internal Audit is not in a position to provide an opinion.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available on file and through the financial management system to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals. The project is not yet complete and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Regarding the Killeens development project, it is important that the project operates within the Public Spending Code framework.

Internal Audit recommend that CCC ensure to in future submit Stage 4 of the CWMF in order to fully comply with stage 3 of the PSC code.

Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied.

Cork City Council should ensure that all relevant employees are aware of their responsibility with regard to the Public Spending Code.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the purchase of land situated in the Killeens area of Cork City and the development of forty-four units with an approved overall budget of €15,917,996. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Killeens Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Finally, to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check Dominick Housing Development

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Dominick Street Housing Development	
Detail	Capital investment programme to develop 9 housing units in Dominick Street, Cork	
Responsible Body	Cork City Council	
Current Status	Expenditure Being Incurred	
Start Date	June 2021	
End Date	March 2024	
Overall Cost	€3,177,288	

Project Description

The project comprises the development of nine new dwellings of one-, two- and three-bedroom units. The development site is located in the north side of the City Centre area of Cork City within the 'Inner City Residential Neighbourhood." The site currently occupied by a derelict building is being renovated and incorporated into the design of the proposed development.

In the Dominick Street area, the housing waiting list for Social Housing currently stood at 2,659 applicants. That broke down into applications for 60 four bed dwellings, 343 three bed, 817 two beds and 1,439 one-bedroom dwellings. This development will therefore meet the need of 9 applicants from that waiting list.

The development of 9 units comprises 1 three-bedroom apartment, 1 two-bedroom apartment and 7 one-bedroom apartments. The development achieves a density of 292 units per hectare which is consistent with delivering best use of the site.

Background

This proposed scheme forms part of the ongoing Competitive Dialogue 'Cork City Council Housing Programme 2021-2023' public procurement process and is a major part of Cork City Council's delivery plan for Rebuilding Ireland as approved by Government in July 2016.

The Council invites proposals from Candidates which can deliver social, affordable, or mixed tenure schemes, to include new build construction, conversion of existing buildings, or a scheme which forms part of a larger development.

Through the Competitive Dialogue procedure, the Council engages with Candidates to identify and define the best means suited to meeting its requirements whether by means of solutions such as the:

- provision of suitable sites, carrying out design and obtaining appropriate planning permissions in partnership with the Council and delivery of housing schemes on selected sites.
- delivery of housing schemes to be ready for occupation by residents under a parallel site Acquisition and Development Agreements with the Council entitled the Cork City Council

Housing Programme 2021-23.

- completion and transfer of suitable existing unfinished housing schemes.
- provision of suitable sites with valid planning permission for a housing development and delivery of such a development.
- delivery of additional units in existing housing schemes.
- delivery and transfer of suitably refurbished housing.
- conversion of existing residential, non-residential, commercial, and industrial buildings to deliver suitable housing.

The Dominic Street development is one of a number of schemes that was shortlisted through the dialogue process. The scheme (alternatives, constraints, costs/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor.

Current Status

A Chief Executive order was made to enter into a Project Agreement with the developer, Mavro Ltd, on the 16th of March 2022, contracts were signed on 16th of November and construction commenced in January 2023. The expected completion date is March 2024.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth check, Cork City Council have completed a Programme Logic Model(PLM) for the Dominick Street Housing Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
Deliver new social housing units to	Capital funding provided by the	Competitive Dialogue Process.	The development of 9 dwelling units	-
support the CCC	Department of	Dialogue Frocess.	in the Dominick	
Housing Program	Housing, Local	Independent	Street area of the	social housing
2021-2023 which	Government and	Valuation.	city.	units in response
forms a key part of	Heritage.			to the demand that
the Rebuilding		Tender process,		exists in Dominick
Ireland,	Site at Dominic	review, selection,		Street Cork.
Government	Street.	and award.		Reducing the
Programme.				numbers on Cork
	Cork City Council	Purchase of the		City Council's
Provide housing to	Staff and	parcels of land that		housing waiting list
meet guidelines for	resources.	make up the site.		and supporting the
the development				Rebuilding Ireland,
of Quality	External	Project		Government
Sustainable	Consultants &	Management.		Programme.
Communities.	Contractors.			
		Recoupment of		
		Capital Grant.		

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objectives of the housing development are to deliver 9 social housing units to support the CCC Housing Program 2021-2023. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the city center area.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding of €3,177,288 approved by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage. The cumulative expenditure to the end of 2022 is €409,206.

Activities: There are a number of key activities being carried out during the project including:

- Competitive Dialogue Process.
- Independent Valuation.
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage.
- Tendering for the suitable developers, review, and award of contracts.
- Purchase of the parcels of land that make up the site.
- Internal approvals through Chief Executive Order.
- Project management and administration of contracts.
- Construction of dwelling units.

Outputs: The expected outputs of the project are nine high quality dwellings with a mix of one, two-bedroom apartments and three-bedroom apartments.

- 7 one-bedroom apartments
- 1 two-bedroom apartment
- 1 three-bedroom apartment

Outcomes: The envisaged outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units of high quality to support the Rebuilding Ireland, Government Programme. In the city, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These nine units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – Dominic Street from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

June 2021	Request to participate in Competitive Dialogue Process initiated.
June 2021	Suitability Assessment Questionnaire Reports reviewed, and short listing of candidates completed.
July 2021	Invitation to Participate in Dialogue process completed, assessment report issued with preferred bidder.
October 2021	Independent Valuation of Dominick Street site.
October 2021	Quantity surveyors report on project delivery costs.
November 2021	Capital Appraisal and DHLGH Stage 1,2 & 3 submission for approval.
January 2022	DHLGH Stage 1,2&3 Approval
February 2022	Dialogue phase for Lots 2C closed.
February 2022	Deadline for receipt of Tender
February 2022	Capital Appraisal and DHLGH Stage 4 submission for approval.
March 2022	DHLGH Stage 4 Approval
March 2022	CE Order approving purchase of site 21 & 22 Dominic Street and appointment of Developer.
November 2022	Contract Awarded
January 2023	On site commencement
March 2024	Substantial Completion

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the Dominick Street Development.

Project/Programme Key Documents			
Title	Details		
Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan	Outlines the key services intended to be delivered to the Cork City public and businesses. during 2022.		
Capital Appraisal for site at Dominick Street, Cork	Appraisal document for the development at Dominick Street, Cork.		
Valuation Report	Independent valuation report of the development at Dominick Street, Cork.		
Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage	Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework.		
Procurement Documents	Competitive Dialogue procurement and tender process documents.		
Deeds of Property	Deeds for properties at Dominick Street.		

Key Document 1: Cork City Council Annual Operational Plan

The Annual Service Delivery Plan is an essential component in delivering the Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 as required by section 50 of the Local Government Reform Act 2014. Cork City Council produces an Annual Service Delivery Plan each year following the adoption of its annual budget to plan its activities for the year ahead. It identifies the key services that Cork City Council intends to deliver to the people and businesses of Cork City. The Operational Plan includes the social housing provision target for each year.

Key Document 2: Capital Appraisal for Development at Dominick Street, Cork.

The appraisal detailed the following:

- Analysis of Housing Need the need for social housing within the city centre area of Cork City.
- Design Brief an outline of the proposed development of thirty dwellings.
- Site Selection assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Project Management Arrangements details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project.

• Initial Cost Estimates – preliminary budget estimate for the development.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council's stage 1 submission to the DHLGH.

Key Document 3: Valuation Report

The Independent Valuation was conducted by external valuers in October 2021. The valuers formed their opinion based on evidence from actual transactions and quoting prices of properties on the market at the time.

Key Document 4: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage approval for the development with a budget of €3,177,288.

Key Document 5: Procurement Documents

In June 2021, Cork City Council launched a competitive dialogue procurement procedure to engage with suitable candidates to identify solutions and opportunities to deliver Cork City Council's Social Housing Programme. The Invitation to Submit a Tender for Lot 2C of the 'Cork City Council Social Housing Programme 2021-23' was issued on the 28th of June 2022. Submissions for Lot 2C were received and assessed by the assessment panels against the 'Award Criteria'. Comprehensive documentation relating to the competitive dialogue process and tender evaluation processes is available on file.

Key Document 6: Deeds of Properties

The deeds for each property are available on file.

Section B – Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the Dominick Street Housing Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Capital Appraisal Report	Outlines the need for the Project (Housing demand numbers, type of units needed, alternative means of meeting the need, site constraints, planning details, cost and vfm, management arrangements, delivery mechanism proposals, programme.	This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council
Valuation Report	To determine the valuation of the site and subsequent development	Information readily available – Available on file
Project File	Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc	Information readily available – Available on file
Costs associated with the project.	To determine the value of the project	Information readily available – Available on file.

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. The initial costs of the project are clearly identified by capital code and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage since they are the approving body.

The project is still being implemented and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages, there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of Dominick Street based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

By utilizing the Competitive Dialogue process, the preferred bidder/developer provided the construction site, and development plan, with pre-approved planning.

Through the dialogue process, the scheme (alternatives, constraints, costs/value for money, risk assessment, design, finishes, etc.) has been assessed and agreed with the Bidder. The project has been subjected to an independent property valuation and the project delivery costings have been reviewed by an independent Chartered Quantity Surveyor. Stages 1, 2 & 3 of the Capital Works Management Framework appraisal (being stage 1. Preliminary business case and stage 2 pre-tender final business case of the PSC code) have all been submitted for approval to the DHLGH at the same time in the process, as the project and associated costs for each stage submission are the same. A stage 4 submission of the Capital Works Management Framework was approved by the DHLGH in March 2022. This satisfies stages 1,2 and 3 of the Appraisal stage of the PSC Code.

The implementation stage has just commenced in November 2022.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available on file and through the financial management system to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals. The project is not yet complete and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Regarding the Dominick Street development project, it is important that the project operates within the Public Spending Code framework. Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied.

Cork City Council should ensure that all relevant employees are aware of their responsibility with regard to the Public Spending Code.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the purchase of land situated at No. 21 and 22 Dominick Street, Cork, and the development of nine dwelling units, with an approved overall budget of €3,177,288. The project is a result of Cork City Council launching a competitive dialogue procedure in June 2021 in order to identify suitable sites or housing projects/schemes that could help deliver the Council's Social Housing Programme for Cork City. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage and progressed through stages of the Capital Works Management Framework.

All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Dominick Street Development Project is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is, subject to the agreed format of the Competitive Dialogue process, in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Finally, to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme

Section A: Introduction

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme	
Detail	Capital investment programme to develop a Flood Relief Scheme to alleviate flooding in Glanmire/Sallybrook, Cork	
Responsible Body	Cork City Council	
Current Status	Expenditure being incurred	
Start Date	2012	
End Date	Expected Substantial Completion Date of Q2 2026	
Overall Cost	€ 19,900,000	

Project Description

Background

The Office of Public Works (OPW) in partnership with both Cork City and Cork County Councils recognised the high levels of existing flood risk in the River Lee Catchment and carried out a Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management (CFRAM) Study for the Lee Catchment which included the Glashaboy River catchment. The Draft Catchment Flood Risk Management Plan was published in February 2010, and this identified a preferred option for the alleviation of flood risk in the Glashaboy catchment.

Significant flooding occurred in June 2012 in the Glanmire/Sallybrook area and as a result Cork County Council, acting as Agents for the OPW commissioned Arup in association with JBA Consulting to develop a viable, cost-effective, and sustainable Scheme, to allow the design flood event along the Glashaboy River and its tributaries without causing flooding of properties, in so doing protecting against flooding from pluvial, fluvial, tidal and surge.

Objectives

Approximately 103 properties (78 residential and 25 commercial) are being protected by the scheme, which will provide standard protection against a flood event, with a 1% probability of occurring in any given year (more commonly known as the one in one-hundred-year flood).

The scheme extends over approximately 4 km of the Glashaboy River, three associated millraces, and lengths of various tributaries including: appropriately 0.5 km of the Butlerstown Stream; approximately 1.8. km of Glenmore Stream (a tributary of Butlerstown Stream) and short lower reaches of various other tributaries.

The estimated construction cost of the scheme is in the region of €20m. The flood relief scheme is funded from within the allocated €1 billion for flood risk management over the period 2018-2027. Provision for the cost of the scheme is included in the Office of Public Works' multi annual capital allocation.

Oversight and Governance

Governance and oversight of the Scheme is being delivered by a Project Steering Group. This is comprised of senior representatives of the Office of Public Works, Cork City Council, Cork County Council, and Arup. The latter named company are the Engineering Consultancy Service Provider appointed by the Project Steering Group and who manage and oversee the implementation of the Scheme on a day-to-day basis.

Monthly progress reports and more recently, weekly progress reports are prepared for the Steering Group. These are comprehensive documents and include the following:

- · Minutes of previous Steering Group meeting
- · Summary of key activities in the period and planned activities
- Review of overall completion programme

- · Health & safety, Risk Management, Legal & contractual issues
- · Decisions to be made

Additional governance measures were added by the Minister when confirming the scheme. An Environmental Monitoring Group (EMG) had to be established and is required to remain in place for the full duration of scheme construction, including the period of implementation of all construction stage mitigation measures. The Group includes representatives of the OPW, Cork County and City Councils.

All updates to the construction work that have potential to impact on the environment are subject to review and formal written agreement by the EMG. The EMG reviews all environmental audit results and ensures remedial actions are agreed and implemented to address any environmental compliance issues on a timely basis. It ensures that environmental impacts during construction do not exceed the envelope of effects predicted in the EIAR and NIS including their addenda.

The EMG also monitors liaison with relevant statutory authorities regarding aspects of construction affecting specific environmental factors.

In May 2019 following the City boundary extension, Cork City Council became the main Contracting Authority with Cork County Council remaining as project managers.

Project stages

The project is being completed in three stages.

- Stage 1: Development of a number of flood defence options and the identification of a preferred Scheme.
- Stage 2: Public Exhibition of Scheme.
- Stage 3: Detailed construction design, compilation of work packages and preparation of tenders for contracts.
- Stage 4: Construction Supervision & Project Management Services
- Stage 5: Handover of the Works.

Project status

Stage 1 & 2 is complete.

An initial screening of a long list of possible flood risk management measures against a predetermined set of criteria, was carried out to determine their potential viability. A technical assessment of potentially viable flood risk management measures was then undertaken.

As the locations at risk are spread over a large area, it was considered appropriate to divide the assessment of the potential flood risk management measures into discrete areas. A shortlist of potential flood relief options was developed for each area and subjected to multiple assessments including economic, environmental, and multi-criteria assessments, resulting in a preferred flood relief option for each area.

The preferred option for each area was further updated following the completion of a detailed hydraulic modelling analysis. Additional conveyance improvements and defence heights greater than the general scheme freeboard were added to ensure the resilience of the preferred option.

December 2015 was the wettest month on records in many areas of Ireland, particularly in the Southwest where rainfall amounts were approximately three times the monthly average. Major flooding on the Glashaboy river led to a further review and refinements of the preferred option.

The preferred option for each area was subjected to a cost benefit analysis and a sensitivity analysis. The result confirmed that the scheme was cost beneficial in all scenarios tested.

Details of the potential flood relief options for each area, the assessments, cost estimates, selection process and preferred option were published in the 2016 Option Report prepared by Arup.

Key elements of the works include:

- Replacement of several existing culverts with either new culverts or bridges and culvert extensions.
- Replacement of Hazelwood Shopping Centre bridge.
- New flood relief channel and culvert at Hazelwood Avenue.
- Replacement of existing flood defence walls and construction of new flood defence walls.
- New surface water pumping station and one foul pumping station.
- Provision of civil works such as road/footpath re-grading at several locations.
- Removal of vegetation and trees.
- Removal and reinstatement of boundary walls and fences.
- Landscaping and replanting of trees on completion
- Ongoing maintenance of the modified river channel.

Stage 3 is complete.

In October 2018, the Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme proposal accompanied by an Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and Natura Impact Statement (NIS) was submitted by the Office of Public Works to the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform for formal Confirmation, under the provisions of the Arterial Drainage Acts,

As a result of changes in EU legislation on environmental matters, there was a requirement for independent consultations and assessments to be conducted by the DPER. Additional information including addenda to the EIAR and NIS was submitted by Cork City Council to the DPER.

On the 18th of January 2021 the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform, Mr. Michael McGrath T.D., in pursuance of the powers given to him by Section 7 of the Arterial Drainage Act, 1945, and of all other powers enabling him in that behalf, announced his consent to proceed with the Glashaboy

River Flood Relief Scheme. The confirmation was subject to conditions set out and agreed to by the Commissioners for Public Works in Ireland who are the sponsoring agency for the scheme which will be implemented by them and Cork City Council.

The project proceeded to tender in October 2021, however in May 2022 and following a successful tender process, the preferred tenderer requested to withdraw their tender, citing changes in the economic climate since the tender process began the previous year. Cork City Council accepted the request and subsequently were not in a position to appoint a contractor.

Cork City Council began the process of retendering and decided to take the opportunity to incorporate some additional junction improvement works (which is being separately funded by LIHAF funding) and some additional flood protection works. Applicable costs were updated to take account of inflation.

Arup were requested to carry out an update of the CBA following which they concluded that there remains a business case for the proposes scheme.

A request to proceed to tender was submitted by Cork City Council to the OPW on the 6th of December 2022 and approval was received on the 21st of December 2022.

The tender for the construction of the project was advertised in January 2023.

Stage 4 has not yet commenced.

Tender submissions are currently being appraised.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
Mitigation of flood risk	Capital funding provided	Issuing a project brief.	Completion of a fit for	The Glashaboy flood relief
events through the town of	by the OPW.		purpose flood relief	scheme is expected to
Glanmire/Sallybrook and		Procuring a consultancy engineering	scheme for Glashaboy	protect the community in
environs.	Cork City & County	company to oversee the designing,	River at	Glanmire/Sallybrook and
	Council Staff.	planning, and building of the scheme.	(Glanmire/Sallybrook).	environs from harmful
Create a flood defence				flooding in the future,
scheme that is technically,	External Consultants &	Implementing a steering group.		including social, economic,
socially, environmentally,	Contractors.			infrastructural, and
and economically		Planning process		environmental harm.
acceptable.				
		Works Contract tender Process,		Improve the quality of life
		review, selection, and award.		for the people of
				Glanmire/Sallybrook.
		Construction Phase:		
		Flood Defence Works		
		General Landscaping		Successful delivery of the
		Culvert Works,		scheme on budget using a
		Bridge Works		Construction Management
		Provision of civil works such as		model
		road/footpath re-grading at		
		several locations, drainage and		
		utility works.		

	Monitoring and tracking of spend on main contracts. Monthly Progress Reports	
	Steering Group Meetings.	
	Monthly Site Reports.	

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objective of the Glashaboy River flood relief scheme is to provide a long-term measure from the risk of flooding to the community of Glanmire/Sallybrook. The project comprises of developing and implementing a flood relief scheme that ensures flood risk can be managed effectively and sustainably into the future.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding which is being provided by the Office of Public Works.

Staff support of a Senior Engineer, Senior Executive Engineer, and two Executive Engineers are required in the oversight and day to day workings of the project. All Staff are permanent City or County Council employees.

Activities: There are a number of key activities that are being carried out throughout the project including.

- Planning and appraisal of the scheme, which has now been completed.
- Tendering for external contractors, currently in progress
- Review and award of contracts
- The construction phase involving the construction of the flood defences proper and other ancillary works such as culvert works, bridge works, road works,
- Monitoring of spend and tracking of budget.
- Project management and administration of contracts
- Governance of project

Outputs: Having carried out the identified activities using the inputs, the output of the project is a fit for purpose flood relief scheme for Glanmire/Sallybrook.

Outcomes: This is a flood relief scheme, and its outcome will be the protection of the lands in Glanmire/Sallybrook. Also, the protection of the environs and the prevention of the social, environmental, infrastructural, and economic harm that flooding damage would cause. A flood relief scheme that provides a Standard of Protection of 1% AEP Fluvial which will be to the benefit and enhancement of the community.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Glashaboy River flood relief scheme from inception to date in terms of major project/programme milestones.

Feb-10	Draft Lee CFRAMS study
Sep-12	Cork County Council Final Project Brief
Dec-13	Consultant awarded contract for design of the entire flood relief scheme.
Jan-14	Final Lee CFRAMS Report
Jan-14	Final Lee CFRMP Report
Jan-14	Glashaboy FRS Scheme Commencement
Feb-14	Public Information Day 1
May-14	Confirmation of funding for the FRS project from OPW
Feb-15	Public Information Day 2
Nov-16	Options Report with cost benefit analysis of preferred flood relief scheme option published.
Nov/Dec 2016	Public Information Day 3
May-18	Environmental Impact Statement
Oct-18	Detailed design with an updated cost benefit analysis reflecting changes to the cost estimate and economic benefit submitted by the OPW to the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform.
Mar-19	Protocol agreed for Cork City Council to take on the contracting authority role on behalf of the OPW with Cork County Council continuing to provide project management for the scheme.
Oct-20	Environmental Impact Statement (Addendum)
Jan-21	Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform, Mr. Michael McGrath T.D., in pursuance of the powers given to him by Section 7 of the Arterial Drainage Act, 1945, and of all other powers enabling him in that behalf, announced his consent to proceed with the Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme.

Oct-21	Construction contract for entire scheme advertised
May-22	Successful Tenderer withdraws prior to contract award citing changes in the economic environment since the time of contract advertisement. Tender competition cancelled
Dec-22	OPW gives approval on revised Tender Package
Jan-23	Open tender competition advertised for construction of FRS

Section B – Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the Glashaboy River (Glanmire/Sallybrook) Drainage Scheme Project.

Project/Programme Key Documents			
Title	Details		
Lee Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management Study	A Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management (CFRAM) Study for the Lee Catchment. The Draft CFRAM was published in February 2010.		
Environmental Impact Assessment Report (2018)	A detailed description of the proposed development comprising information on the site, design and size and environmental impact of the proposed development		
Environmental Impact Assessment Report Addendum (2020)	Issued in response to the request for further information by the office of Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform		
Consultancy Engineers Options Appraisal report	This outlines the flood risk options available to meet the flood risk objectives. Numerous assessments on a shortlist of options. Selection and recommendation of a preferred option.		
Cost Benefit Analysis	This output provided an economic assessment of the costs and benefits of the scheme in order to determine if the scheme was economically justifiable		
Letters from OPW	Approval from OPW for progressing with the flood relief scheme in Glashaboy and confirmation of funding.		
Minutes of meetings of Steering Group	This documentary evidence of agendas and minutes of meetings that were held. The minutes provide a comprehensive record of those present, matters discussed, outcomes agreed, and actions required along with assigned responsibilities		
Progress Reports (2014-2022)	On-Going Project Management Reports for the Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme.		

Financial Reports	Detailed cost code reports from Cork County Council and City Council's financial reporting system of expenditure and receipts. Cost projection reports prepared by Project Team for the OPW Cost v tender cost reports prepared by ARUP.
Chief Executive Orders	Contracts made on behalf of the council and affixes the official seal of the council on documents.

Key Document 1: Lee Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management Study (and the South-West CFRAM Study)

The Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme was developed in response to the findings of the Lee Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management Study, which recommended the implementation of a scheme of flood relief measures for risk areas including the Glanmire/Sallybrook area.

The following was recommended for the Glashaboy sub-catchment:

- Permanent flood walls/embankments, culverts and bridge works, vegetation clearing, individual property protection, and a pumping station. (to manage fluvial risk)

Key Document 2: Environmental Impact Assessment Report

The Glashaboy River Flood Relief scheme necessitated an EIS which is an assessment that is carried out accordance with the relevant provisions of Directive 2011/92/EU on the Assessment of the Effects of Certain Public and Private Projects on the Environment and in accordance with the relevant provisions set out in Directive 2014/52/EU which amends Directive 2011/92/EU.

It is the process for evaluating the likely environmental impacts of the Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme, taking into account inter-related socio-economic, cultural, and human-health impacts, both beneficial and adverse. The EIS is a very comprehensive document prepared on behalf of Cork County Council by environmental specialists under the supervision of Arup. It explores the scheme in detail with some of the major headings being.

- . A description of the proposed scheme
- · Alternatives considered in the development of the scheme
- · The Planning & Development Context
- · The aspects of the environment considered
- · Other Interactions

It concludes that, subject to the mitigation measures proposed, and the conditions set out, the effects of the proposed development on the environment and human health would be acceptable.

Key Document 3: Environmental Impact Statement Addendum

Under the relevant legislation, the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform is required to carry out an Environmental Impact Assessment of the proposed scheme. Having reviewed the submission, the Minister requested further information on the 2018 Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and scheme.

The request is addressed by means of an addendum to the original EIAR. The addendum consisted of a request for information on nine items. The nine items can be summarised as follows:

- 1. Competency details for all personnel and firms who provided significant inputs to the EIAR.
- 2. Further information to clearly show how environmental considerations were taken into account during consideration of alternatives.
- 3. Further details of proposed widening, deepening, realignment, and regrading of river channels and of future maintenance works.
- 4. An updated Hydrology assessment to ensure full assessment of the worst case likely significant effects on water quality during construction and maintenance.
- 5. Provision of updates to assessment of impacts in all other specialist sections of the original EIAR to ensure that they meet certain additional criteria.
- 6. Mitigation measures and monitoring proposals are to be revised and augmented, as required to ensure that they meet certain additional criteria.
- 7. All monitoring proposals should be accompanied by appropriate and clear remedial or other actions which will be implemented in event of exceedances of trigger levels, to ensure that acceptable limits are not exceeded.
- 8. Updates to assessments of residual impacts in the specialist sections to meet certain additional criteria.
- 9. A revised Construction and Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) clearly showing specific procedures and measures that contractors will be required to adhere to during the construction and maintenance phase.

The Addendum was prepared on behalf of Cork City Council by Arup and published in October 2020. There were no material changes to the proposed scheme resulting from the response to the request for further information. Additional mitigation measures were included, where necessary.

Key Document 4: Options Appraisal Report

This Options Assessment Report was produced as part of Stage I of the project and would have been read in conjunction with the Constraints Study, Hydrology Report, and the Hydraulics Report.

The purpose of the report published in 2016 was to assess all possible flood relief options that could be implemented in the Glanmire/Sallybrook area and outline the procedure for development and selection of the preferred option. The contents of the report included the following:

- An initial screening and further assessment of potential flood relief measures.
- An economic assessment of the shortlisted options
- Multi-Criteria Assessment of the shortlisted options
- Development and recommendation of a preferred option.
- Cost Benefit Analysis of the preferred option.

Approval was received from the OPW for the approval of Arup Options Report for the progressing to the tendering process for the project. Approval was also awarded by OPW for the appointment and committing to funding of the consultants costs for each phase.

The Optionering phase and the Options Report satisfies stage 1 of the PSC Code.

Key Document 5: Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA)

The purpose of the Cost Benefit Analysis is to provide a background of the flood defence scheme, details of the costs of the scheme and also a description of the cost-benefit analysis process.

The Cost Benefit Analysis was prepared by a firm of consulting engineers and was prepared to best professional standards. It is a comprehensive analysis of the scheme and contains detailed analysis on cost estimation, cost benefit and the cost benefit analysis itself. In line with the Office of Public Works requirements the benefits of the scheme were assessed over a 50-year life cycle.

The CBA was included as part of the 2016 Options Report with the iterations at the detailed design stage and prior to going to tender stage being the latest iteration. These updates followed further refinements to the preferred option.

The Cost Benefit Analysis Report and iterations of same satisfies the requirements of the Public Spending Code.

Key Document 6: Letters from OPW

Approval was received from the OPW for the progressing and confirmed funding of the flood relief scheme. Approval was received for the progressing to the tendering process for the project.

Key Document 7: Steering Group Minutes

In compliance with the requirements of the Public Spending Code a formal structure was put in place, a project manager was appointed, and a project steering group was set up. Steering group members include representatives from Cork City Council, Cork County Council, OPW and from other stakeholders as required. There is documentary evidence of agendas and minutes of all

meetings that have been held in relation to the project. The minutes show topics discussed by the attendees, outcomes agreed, and actions required along with assigned responsibilities.

Key Document 8: Progress Reports

This review examined several reports including a sample of the Progress Reports, of which up to ten are produced per year. These reports detail the progress of the scheme under the following main headings.

- Details of key activities in the period, including updates on Health & Safety, Procurement,
 Risk Management and Environmental issues.
- Summary of critical activities ongoing and planned for the next period.
- Information management and Steering Group Liaisons.
- Stakeholder Management

The monthly progress reports moved to a weekly basis in mid 2022 during the re-tender preparation phase.

These reports represent an on-going evaluation of the scheme.

Key Document 9: Financial Reports

Detailed cost code reports from City Council's financial reporting system analysing expenditure costs and recoupment of costs by:

Contractor

Vendor

Purchase Orders

Project

Work Completion Certificates (when construction commences)

Quarterly/Half yearly cost projection reports prepared by Project Team for the OPW.

Key Document 10: Chief Executive Orders

A number of Chief Executive Orders were looked at for this project. In order for payments to be awarded there must be a signed Chief Executive Order.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the Glashaboy River (Glanmire/Sallybrook) Flood Relief Scheme Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Lee CFRAM Study	Project Appraisal and justification of the requirement for the Flood Relief Scheme.	Information readily available -Available on file
Environmental Impact Assessment Report (2018)	A description of the proposed development comprising information on the site, design, and size of the proposed development.	Information readily available -Available on file
Consultants Engineers Options Report	Economic, environmental appraisals and multi-criteria assessments of flood relief options and the recommendation of a preferred option for the Flood Relief scheme.	Information readily available -Available on file
Cost Benefit Analysis	This analysis provides an economic assessment of the costs and benefits of the scheme in order to determine if the scheme is economically justifiable.	Information readily available -Available on file
Sample of Tender Documentation	Basis of assessment for award of scheme component works	Information readily available -Available on file
Financial Data from the Council's financial management system.	To confirm receipts for recoupment of costs and payments to contractors, Monitoring of costs against tenders and change orders.	Information readily available – Available on JDEdwards financial management system

Project Progress Reports 2014-2022	Assess the reporting and monitoring of the project as it progresses.	Information readily available – Available on file
Monthly site reports	Assesses the progress of the project during the construction phase	Should be available once contractor is appointed and construction begins.
Minutes of steering committee meetings	Briefing on progress of project. Consulting on issues, risks, and costs.	Information readily available – Available on file
Correspondence from and to the OPW	To confirm approval was sought in a timely manner. To confirm recoupment of monies was completed	Information readily available – Available on file
Chief Exec orders	Approval for all costs relating to the project.	Information readily available – Available on file

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

Internal Audit is satisfied that the financial data requirements are available on the Councils Financial Systems. The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. All financial records, associated costs of the project, receipts are clearly identified and can be traced back to the financial management system.

The project is still being implemented and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages, there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

Data in relation to the project site reports will be available as the project progresses. This information will help evaluate the performance of the contractor and allow the council to minimise the possibility of cost over-runs when construction begins.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The in-depth check demonstrates that the principles and tenets of the Public Spending Code were and are being adhered to in the on-going management and appraisal of the scheme. The CFRAM report, Options report, comprehensive Environmental Impact Statements, and constant reviewing of the CBA are evidence of the approach adopted at the appraisal stage of the scheme.

Based on the in-depth review undertaken, it appears that the Glashaboy Flood Relief Scheme is substantially in compliance with the Public Spending Code. There is a steering group in place and formal structures and schedules are in place for continuous progress reporting and risk reporting. A project manager has been assigned within Cork County Council on behalf of the contracting authority, Cork City Council. Minutes are available of all meetings covering significant development to date.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All information and supporting documents that were requested during the review were provided and are maintained and would be readily available for a full evaluation at a later date. Key documentation such as the CFRAM, Options Report, Environmental Impact Statement Addendum and the Cost Benefit Analysis reports are available. Furthermore, all tender documentation and copies of the monthly/weekly Progress Reports along with minutes of meetings and all correspondences are carefully filed. There is sufficient data and information available on file through the financial management system to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through the Councils financial management systems.

The project is currently at tender stage and therefore no conclusion can be made on data related to future events and expenditure, however based on the quality of information available at the initial stages, there are good processes in place for the recording and maintenance of information for future evaluation of the project.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Regarding the Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme project, it is important that the project continues to operate within the Public Spending Code framework. Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, as per Public Spending Code requirement, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied.

It is important where design changes, cost increases or time delays are identified that the steering group continue to re-evaluate total project costs, to ensure additional costs or overruns are mitigated.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme at Glanmire/Sallybrook.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme has the objective of being a technically, socially, environmentally, and economically acceptable alleviation of the risk of flooding to the Glanmire/Sallybrook areas and environs. The project stems from the Lee Catchment Flood Risk Assessment and Management Study (and the South-West CFRAM Study) which identified Glanmire/Sallybrook as vulnerable to significant flooding. This scheme is led by Cork County Council and Cork City Council with participation by the OPW and the steering group established for the project.

Appropriate appraisal of the scheme was conducted as evidenced by the Environmental Impact Statement addendum. In addition, the Cost Benefit Analysis provides an economic assessment of the costs and benefits of the scheme and in so doing highlights the economic justification for the scheme. On-going monitoring and evaluation of the scheme's implementation is met through the comprehensive monthly management reports that are prepared. The appropriate documentation and data are available for any future evaluation of the Scheme.

Pre-Tender approval was received from the Sanctioning Body, the OPW, and the tender process is currently in progress and adhering to proper procurement procedures. The main works construction contract is scheduled to commence in July 2023 and to be substantially completed in 32 months. All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project. There is strong project management in situ and a system of robust controls in place as the project progresses.

The project has been impacted by delays at the appraisal stage because of new procedures introduced as a result of changes in EU legislation, and delays due to the original preferred works contractor requesting their removal from the tender process in 2022.

The thresholds and methodologies for appraisal set out in the PSC indicate that projects between €5 million and €20 million should be subject to preliminary and detailed appraisal, which includes, at a minimum a Multi-Criteria Analysis (MCA). On this project an MCA was documented for all shortlisted options. An economic assessment of the costs and benefits (CBA) highlights the economic justification of the scheme. The scheme at optioneering stage forecasts a CBA return ratio of 1.3. The CBA underwent various iterations as a result of refinements and cost increases due to inflation. At tendering stage, the revised CBA is forecasting a return ratio of .9 which is marginally below parity.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred, Glashaboy River Flood Relief Scheme is well managed, and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in substantial compliance with the Public Spending Code

Finally, to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.